

## Murder

### 18-20 year old Offenders

**Maximum Penalty:** Life (s.19A (NSW) Crimes Act)

**Standard non-parole period** (offences committed on or after 1.2.2003)

20 years

25 years - Where the victim was a police officer, emergency services worker, correctional officer, judicial officer, health worker, teacher, community worker, or other public official, exercising public or community functions and the offence arose because of the victim's occupation or voluntary work

**Standard non-parole period** (where conviction entered or plea of guilty made on or after 1.1.2008)

25 years - Where the victim a child under 18 years of age

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
1.	<b>McCABE</b> (19) NSWSC Abadee J 14.12.1990  NSWCCA 14.10.1991	PG	MT 15y AT 5y	AA MT 9y AT 7y	minor	stabbing	Repeatedly stabbed elderly neighbour while attempting to rob. Mother of young baby.

**This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.**

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
2.	<b>MIHAILOVIC</b> (18y 5m) NSWSC B- Parker J 15.4.1991  <b>HOWARD</b> (18y 2m) NSWSC B- Parker J 30.8.1991  Co-Offender: MORGAN	VG	MT 10y AT 8y  MT 8y AT 5y	AD (1992) 29 NSWLR 242	nil  minor	assault  intent GBH / joint enterprise to assault	Gang homosexual bashing – victim lured to toilet and attacked - beating and kicking H some assistance to police.
3.	<b>PHILLIPS</b> (18) NSWSC Mathews J 21.5.1991  NSWCCA 14.11.1991	VG	MT 15y AT 9y	AD	nil	stabbing  intent kill	Stabbed neighbour's wife in front of 2 young children Diminished responsibility rejected - psychiatric condition.
4.	<b>WEBSTER</b> (18) NSWCCA 15.7.1991	PG	MT 14y AT 6y	AD	nil	assault	Choked and crushed head with rock when 14y female resisted attempted rape at party Intoxicated.
5.	<b>MILES</b> (18) NSWSC 23.3.1992 Mathews J  NSWCCA 28.3.1995	VG	MT 12y 6m AT 5y 6m	Conviction AD	nil	stabbing	Crime of passion against ex-girlfriend Diminished responsibility rejected.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
6.	<b>KNOWLSON</b> (18y 9m)  <b>PERKINS</b> (18y 3m)  NSWSC Enderby J 21.5.1992	PG  PG	MT 12y AT 6y  MT 8y AT 7y		prior offences	strangulation / stabbing  intent kill	Premeditated killing of old man K dominant offender P suffering brain damage from petrol sniffing and intellectual disability
7.	<b>SHARPE</b> (19) NSWSC Wood J 10.9.1992	PG	MT 10y AT 8y		minor - disregarded	assault and strangulation  intent GBH	Went to aunt's home in early hours of morning to sexually assault her - struck her with poker and strangled with cord.
8.	<b>DAVISON</b> (19) NSWSC Wood J 11.9.1992	PG	MT 13y 5m AT 7y		nil	strangulation / stabbing	Killed girlfriend – assault causing fractures to head - set body alight after death
9.	<b>GILL</b> (18) NSWSC Mathews J 9.2.1993	VG	MT 10y 6m AT 6y 6m		very minor	assault  reckless indifference	Affected by liquor - assaulted girlfriend - kicked 27m old stepson, picked him up by ankles and threw to ground.
10.	<b>CATON</b> (18)  <b>McDONALD</b> (19)  NSWSC Levine J 12.3.1993  (McDonald) NSWCCA 18.8.1994	VG Murder  PG Rob in Co  PG	MT 10y AT 5y  MT 18y AT 6y		minor  AA MT 15y AT 7y	shooting  common purpose robbery  intent kill	Intending to steal taxi told driver to get out and run - shot to prevent identification.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	<b>NAME (age if known)</b>	<b>PLEA</b>	<b>SENTENCE</b>	<b>APPEAL</b>	<b>RECORD</b>	<b>HOW KILLED</b>	<b>INVOLVEMENT &amp; SUMMARY</b>
11.	<b>O'BRIEN</b> (19) NSWCCA 10.6.1993	PG	MT 10y AT 6y	Crown AA MT 12y AT 6y	BES – stealing – AOABH - mal damage	shooting  felony murder	Entered bedroom with loaded rifle and shot victim when challenged. Crown appeal - withdrew offer to assist
12.	<b>MOORE</b> (19) NSWSC Wood J 5.8.1993  NSWCCA 21.6.1995	VG	MT 10y AT 5y	Conviction AD	minor	stabbing	Drunken fight between friends – victim stabbed 6 times Offender called ambulance - claimed self defence
13.	<b>CAMPBELL</b> (20) NSWSC Abadee J 3.9.1993	VG	MT 5y 7m AT 4y		lengthy record – property, assault and robbery offences	assault	Victim bashed with punches, kicks and striking of head with brick - body weighted down with bricks and thrown into river - group involved.
14.	<b>NORRIS</b> (18) NSWSC 27.9.1993 James J	PG	MT 10y AT 5y		minor	assault  Intent GBH	Fatally assaulted 2y daughter of de facto –sustained assault to entire body – hit head against wall – hit head with architrave Intoxicated and distressed after grandmother's funeral – alcohol problem – immature – contrition
15.	<b>DAVIS</b> (18y 3d) NSWSC Campbell J 28.10.1993  Co-offender: WIGGINS	PG	MT 13y AT 7y		mainly dishonesty	shooting  intent kill	Victim lured to isolated area and shot - offenders believed he was ripping them off over drug crop they all involved in.
16.	<b>HUNGERFORD</b> (20) NSWCCA 15.12.1993	PG	MT 18y AT 6y	AD (top of range)	nil of consequence	assault	Abducted and sexually assaulted 49y woman - bashed skull with piece of concrete.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
17.	<b>SCROOP</b> (20) NSWSC Barr AJ 16.9.1994	PG	MT 12y AT 6y		AOABH	assault	Attacked female following sexual intercourse – met victim that evening – unprovoked, prolonged and violent attack resulting in severe injuries to victim – offender just “snapped” - hid victim’s body in nearby concrete pipe Difficult aggressive behaviour since childhood – alcohol and substance abuse
18.	<b>HUGHES</b> (20) NSWSC 16.12.1994 B-Parker J  Co-offender: ASHFIELD	PG	MT 16y AT 5y			assault  intent GBH	Assault on 6y old son causing death from head injuries - extensive bruises to head and body - head forced into wall – placed phone book on head and hit with hammer - initially blamed gang then tried to shift major blame to other offender - claimed victim had interfered with younger sister
19.	<b>PILLER</b> (20) NSWSC Dowd J 6.7.1995  Co-offender: KRAMER	VG	MT 13y AT 5y		Nil	Shooting  Felony murder	Shooting of Pizza Hut employee during armed robbery with shotgun – K waited in car
20.	<b>DANIELSON</b> (18) NSWSC Smart J 27.6.1995	VG	MT 9y AT 5y		minor	stabbing with glass  intent GBH	In early hours of morning confrontation developed between victim and acquaintance of offender – victim kicked acquaintance and made threats – offender stabbed victim in neck with broken glass – spontaneous – excessive defence of another – major over-reaction Islander heritage - prior good character at school and church – deep remorse and shame – good prospects of rehabilitation – father to young child
21.	<b>JOHNSON</b> (18) NSWSC Ireland J 24.4.1996  Co-offender: GAC	VG Murder  Rob with wounding	MT 8y AT 4y		record	assault  felony murder / common purpose	Group of young persons assaulted elderly vagrant in park.

**This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.**

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
22.	<b>GLASBY</b> (20) NSWSC Sully J 11.11.1997	PG	MT 9y AT 3y		minor	shooting  intent kill	Female - lured victim away on pretence of sex – victim shot by dominating husband to fulfil contract killing
23.	<b>SPEDDING</b> (20) NSWCCA 11.12.1997	VG Murder  2 x conceal dead body	MT 11y AT 4y	AD		shooting	Group of four travelling / living together - during argument shot victim - buried body in the bush.
24.	<b>GRAFF</b> (20)       <b>LEAITUALES</b> (19)  NSWSC Barr J 25.9.1998  <a href="#">[2001] NSWCCA 3</a>  Co-offender: RT	PG Murder  Rob in Co  Sched: AOABH Mal inflict gbh  PG Murder  Rob in Co	MT 18y AT 5y     MT 10y AT 6y	AD	minor record - on bail at time of offending     no significant history	assault	Punched and kicked taxi driver in the head and body - stripped and whipped him with his belt - drove off in taxi - no reason for attack - equal culpability. Robbery of taxi driver nine days earlier - took taxi and money. G: History of alcohol and violence - low intellectual functioning - considered leader of group. L: Difficult background - previously stabbed - alcohol addiction - low intellectual functioning and depression lessened criminal responsibility
25.	<b>HEARNE</b> (19) <a href="#">[1999] NSWSC 605</a> Wood CJ at CL  (2001) 124 A Crim R 451 <a href="#">[2001] NSWCCA 37</a>	PG Murder  Mal wound W/I to do GBH	MT 20y AT 7y  FT 6y (concurrent)	AA 18y NPP 13y  FT 6y  Total: 21y NPP 16y	insignificant	stabbing  intent GBH	Stabbed two off-duty police after offering them illegal drugs and they asked for identification - seeking to prevent apprehension - impulsive - not aware police officers. Remorse - surrendered self to police - youth.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.



	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
30.	<b>VALERA</b> (19) <a href="#">[2000] NSWSC 1220</a> Studdert J  <a href="#">[2002] NSWCCA 50</a>	VG 2 x murder	Life	AD	nil	assault / strangulation  intent kill	Bashed to death 59y male in victim's home then mutilated body - two weeks later bashed and strangled 68y male in victim's home and mutilated body - savage attacks - random and utterly senseless killings – mutilation and treatment of bodies showed utter contempt for victims and exuded evil Physically and verbally abused by father throughout childhood - mother left home when offender aged 3y
31.	<b>GOSLING</b> (18) <a href="#">[2001] NSWSC 850</a> Howie J  <a href="#">[2002] NSWCCA 351</a>	VG	16y NPP 12y	Conviction AD	on bond for assault on father	shooting  intent GBH	Shot dead victim during attack with three co-offenders as pay back for alleged insulting behaviour of victim towards mother of one co-offender - culpability somewhat reduced by mental disorder - manipulated by co-offender
32.	<b>RATU</b> (18) <a href="#">[2001] NSWSC 1183</a> Levine J  <a href="#">[2003] NSWCCA 258</a>  Co-offender: HOLMES	PG (25%)	16y NPP 12y	AD	nil relevant	assault  intent GBH	Taxi driver attacked after attempting to prevent offenders running off - kicked, punched and stomped for over 10 minutes. Genuine contrition and remorse- good prospects of rehabilitation
33.	<b>EZOLD</b> (19) <a href="#">[2002] NSWSC 129</a> Barr J  Co-accused: FARRELL	VG	16y NPP 12y		nil	assault and drowning  intent to kill	Group assault on male acquaintance - led group to place of assault and struck first blow with bottle - victim drowned by co-offender - planned offence - under strong and brutal influence of co-offender Genuine remorse - evidence of rehabilitation

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.



	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
34.	<b>HAMZY</b> (19) <a href="#">[2002] NSWSC 128</a> Bell J  <a href="#">[2004] NSWCCA 243</a>	VG Murder  Mal wound w/i GBH  Mal discharge weapon w/i  Threaten to use weapon  Conspiracy to murder  Sched: 3 offences	21y NPP 15y 9m  FT 5y  FT 3y  FT 3y  12y NPP 6y  <u>Total:</u> 27y 9m NPP 21y 9m	AD	Sentence imposed partially cumulative to sentence for unrelated drug offences committed between commission of murder and arrest	shooting  intent to kill	Fired at group of men involved in disturbance outside nightclub - deliberately fired while victim on ground - no premeditation but went to nightclub armed with gun - shot at other men and pointed weapon at police attempting to apprehend - left country – while in custody on remand attempted to arrange murder of Crown witness. Disturbed childhood - exposed to serious criminal activity of father at early age - heavy drug use - totality
35.	<b>P PHAM</b> (18 at offence) <a href="#">[2002] NSWSC 1261</a> Sully J  Co-offender: TRAN NGUYEN	VG	16y NPP 11y		record unclear but not significant	shooting  intent to kill	(1996) Execution in context of gang involvement - victim taken to oval by offenders at night and shot four times by co-offender PP - Vietnamese - difficult childhood - refugee - drugs - need for psychiatric care - important co-operation with police
36.	<b>FARRELL</b> (19) <a href="#">[2002] NSWSC 375</a> Barr J  Co-accused: EZOLD	VG	18y NPP 13y 6m		no relevant criminal history	assault  intent to kill	With co-offenders bashed to death victim on deserted beach - group of homeless young people who had made "pact" to kill victim - had consumed alcohol and LSD - premeditated Deprived background.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
37.	<b>CHAN</b> (19) <a href="#">[2002] NSWSC 544</a> Ireland AJ	VG	14y NPP 9y		nil	shooting	Shot service station operator in chest after victim had verbal exchange with offender's friend Substantial impairment defence rejected - suffering Tourette's syndrome, obsessive compulsive disorder and schizophrenic psychosis - also aggressive and given to acting impulsively and recklessly - capacity to control self substantially impaired but not so as to reduced offence to manslaughter Native of Hong Kong - family support - delay - prospects of rehabilitation
38.	<b>MCLEAN</b> (18) <a href="#">[2002] NSWSC 1042</a> Wood CJ at CL  Co-offender: SJB	PG (20%) Murder  Take and drive conveyance	19y NPP 13y  FT 6m (concurrent)		no violence	stabbing  intent to kill	McL angered by sexual affair between SJB (female) and victim -agreed to stab victim - multiple stab wounds in car - equal involvement in killing Both suffered limited intellectual resources, impulsiveness and ADHD - offence out of character - offenders involved in destructive relationship
39.	<b>WILSON</b> (18) <a href="#">[2004] NSWSC 597</a> Simpson J  (2005) 152 A Crim R 257 <a href="#">[2005] NSWCCA 112</a>	PG (25%)	12y NPP 8y	Crown AA 15y NPP 11y	Nil	Stabbing  Intent GBH	Stabbed taxi driver in remote area during argument over fare – no premeditated intent to rob – burned taxi and stole money Originally found unfit to plead and sentenced after special hearing – dysfunctional childhood – low intelligence and depression – successful efforts at rehabilitation
40.	<b>GONZALES</b> (20) <a href="#">[2004] NSWSC 822</a> James J  (2007) 178 A Crim R 232 <a href="#">[2007] NSWCCA 321</a>	VG 3 x Murder	Life	AD	Nil	Stabbing - striking and strangling  Intent to kill	Stabbed father, mother and 18y sister in their home - made it look like racially motivated attack – premeditated – tried to poison mother 10 days before murder - false alibi – no mitigation of objective seriousness of offence – no contrition - dangerousness
41.	<b>VANN</b> (20) <a href="#">[2004] NSWSC 988</a> Dunford J	PG (13%) Murder  Assault	19y NPP 14y 3m  FT 18m (concurrent)		Possess knife in public place	Shooting  Intent to kill	Shot 16y male stranger with SKS rifle during fight outside cinema – called to cinema to assist

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
42.	<b>O'CONNELL</b> (18) <a href="#">[2004] NSWSC 1120</a> Davidson AJ  <a href="#">[2006] NSWCCA 82</a>	PG (20%)	35y NPP 25y	AD	Juvenile record for serious crimes of violence	Assault and stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Killed 15y girl with whom he was having casual relationship – horrific wounds – 49 injuries, including 10 stab wounds - violent sexual proclivities – disposed of body in nearby garbage bin – deliberately attempted to divert suspicion Victim of abuse by stepfathers – drug and alcohol problems – dyslexia/ADHD – remorse – youth – but for youth and plea, life sentence would have been imposed – limited protective custody
43.	<b>CLEVERLY</b> (18) <a href="#">[2004] NSWSC 1279</a> Mathews AJ  <a href="#">[2007] NSWCCA 169</a>	VG  Sched: Agg kidnap Att pervert course of justice	24y NPP 18y	Conviction AD	Nil	Strangulation  Intent to kill	Strangled aunt in her home – possibly motivated by financial gain – premeditated – higher end of range Brain injury at least affected judgment.
44.	<b>DEHAYBI</b> (20) <a href="#">[2005] NSWSC 128</a> Levine J  (2006) 160 A Crim R 392 <a href="#">[2006] NSWCCA 31</a>	VG Murder  s.33  AR	24y NPP 18y  12y NPP 9y  FT 6y  <u>Total:</u> 26y NPP 20y	AD / Crown AD	Breached bond for dishonesty offences	Stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> With brother pre-planned armed robbery of family attempting to sell engagement ring – during struggle fatally stabbed adult son and stabbed father in chest
45.	<b>EM</b> (19) <a href="#">[2005] NSWSC 212</a> James J  <a href="#">[2006] NSWCCA 336</a>	VG: Murder  s 97(2)  s 93G(1)(c)  PG 5 x s 97(2)	25y NPP 16y  FT 10y  FT 2y  FT 12y  <u>Total:</u> 36y NPP 27y	AD	Driving offences	Shooting  Constructive murder	Home invasion with co-offender – 5 occupants forced to lie on floor – victim shot and killed in struggle – victim's wife shot in thumb – 10 days later, similar offence with 2 co-offenders - robbery completed and 5 occupants left tied up in house Cambodian – poly substance abuse – mood disorder

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
46.	<b>WEIGHTMAN</b> (20) <a href="#">[2005] NSWSC 1354</a> Hidden J  Co-offender: DONAI	PG (combined 30%) 2 x Murder	25y NPP 19y  Total: 28y NPP 22y		Minor	Asphyxiation  Intent to kill	Killed adoptive parents for financial reasons – planned killing with co-offender – victims sedated in own home and smothered – bodies placed in car crash scene – co-offender killed mother – assisted in killing of father Early stages of mental illness at time of offences – influenced by drugs and co-offender – favourable prospects of rehabilitation
47.	<b>HOHAIA</b> (18) <a href="#">[2006] NSWSC 866</a> Kirby J  <a href="#">[2015] NSWCCA 91</a>  Co-offender: ABDULKADER	VG Murder  Rob in Co  AOABH	24y NPP 18y  FT 18m  FT 9m (concurrent)	AA 24y NPP 18y  FT 18m  FT 9m (concurrent)	Priors – no violence	Assault  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Sustained assault on male acquaintance over several hours – victim assaulted by H in home of H's mother – victim robbed of mobile phone and wallet, forced to reveal PIN and taken to ATM to obtain money – subjected to further assault by both offenders and left for dead – H principal offender – A lesser offender but involved in second, fatal assault on victim - no clear motive H - also sentenced for assault on male in company with friend three months earlier – sustained attack with no motive - disrupted childhood with early drug abuse
48.	<b>NGUYEN</b> (20) <a href="#">[2007] NSWSC 389</a> Whealy J	PG (25%)	18y NPP 13y 6m		Criminal record for lesser offences – breached parole	Stabbing  Felony murder	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed shop owner during attempted robbery of newsagency – repeated stabbing - below mid-range – spontaneous and unplanned killing Long history of drug addiction
49.	<b>HOURI</b> (19) <a href="#">[2007] NSWSC 615</a> Buddin J  Co-offender: A	PG Murder  Sched: 3 x BES	18y NPP 12y 6m		Nil relevant	Stabbing  Felony murder / intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed console operator during armed robbery of service station – unprovoked attack on co-operating victim – use of weapon – in company – vulnerable victim – mid range offence Troubled childhood with heavy drug and alcohol addiction – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – serious physical disability resulting from shooting subsequent to offence - depression
50.	<b>ZARO</b> (18) <a href="#">[2007] NSWSC 756</a> Howie J  <a href="#">[2009] NSWCCA 219</a>	VG	22y NPP 16y 6m	AD	Nil	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Fatally stabbed male friend after evening of drinking and playing computer games – made younger friend watch deliberate killing – angered by perceived breakdown in relationship with girlfriend – intoxicated – above mid-range seriousness Born in Iraq – no mental disorder – family support

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
51.	<b>HARVEY</b> (18) <a href="#">[2007] NSWSC 871</a> Howie J	PG (15%)	16y NPP 10y		Minor	Assault  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> After evening of drinking assaulted male friend with piece of wood – fatal head injuries – no motive – suffering severe mental illness – paranoid schizophrenia – spontaneous offence – well below mid-range Long history of mental illness
52.	<b>TA'ALA</b> (20) <a href="#">[2008] NSWCCA 132</a>	PG (13%) Murder  Murder	26y NPP 19y 6m  35y NPP 26y 6m  <u>Total:</u> 47y NPP 38y 6m	AA 26y NPP 19y 6m  35y NPP 23y 3m  <u>Total:</u> 47y NPP 35y 3m		Bashing and stabbing  Intent to kill	(2002) - Beat first victim with cricket bat over head – argument as to drug dealing – bashed and stabbed second female victim who had witnessed attack – extreme violence. On appeal corrected SJ's intention to set NPP at 75% of total sentence
53.	<b>POCOCK</b> (20) <a href="#">[2008] NSWSC 1435</a> Latham J	PG (15%)	19y 6m NPP 14y 9m		Breached bond for violence offences	Assault  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Confronted male victim in street about stolen handbag – punched and kicked victim and stomped on head – no threat or provocation offered by victim – failed to provide assistance – under influence of alcohol and ecstasy – below mid-range Remorse – exposed as a child to domestic violence
54.	<b>SHAMOUIL</b> (20) <a href="#">[2009] NSWSC 24</a> Hidden J	PG (15%)	19y NPP 14y 6m  (partially concurrent with existing sentences for attempt murder and drug supply)		Attempted murder – breached bail – committed subsequent offence of supply comm. qty amphet	Shooting  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Co-offender arranged to meet victim at service station to discuss argument with offender's female cousin – Offender shot victim three times during argument – spontaneous offence – below mid-range. Assyrian – difficult childhood – carried gun as protection after exposure to violence – remorse Co-offenders sentenced for accessory after fact to murder

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
55.	<b>BARRETT</b> (20) <a href="#">[2009] NSWSC 338</a> Mathews AJ  Co-offender FORDHAM	PG (12.5%)	22y NPP 16y		Nil	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Female offender - arranged murder of ex-partner – victim became frustrated at offender's lack of response and sent threatening SMS messages – disproportionate response to threats due to heavy cannabis consumption – meticulously planned killing with male friend – lured victim interstate – multiple stab wounds inflicted by co-offender – both offenders inflicted final stab wound – instigator of plan – above mid-range Abusive childhood – smoking marijuana by 12y – remorse – two young children
56.	<b>CARR</b> (18) <a href="#">[2009] NSWSC 995</a> McClellan CJ at CL	PG (15%)	16y NPP 12y		Lengthy criminal record including violence – breached conditional liberty	Stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Single stab wound to chest of male acquaintance outside party – spontaneous offence – earlier argument inside house – offence moderately below mid-range Aboriginal - under influence of alcohol, ice and cannabis – severe drug addiction – deprived background
57.	<b>DENNIS</b> (19) <a href="#">[2009] NSWSC 1357</a> Barr AJ  <a href="#">[2012] NSWCCA 120</a>  <a href="#">[2015] NSWCCA 61</a>	VG	26y 8m NPP 20y	Conviction AD   Sentence AD	Nil	Assault  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 25 years</b> Assaulted 23m son of girlfriend while in his care – hit head with blunt instrument or forced head against wall – placed child back in cot – spontaneous offence – circumstances of offence unclear Exemplary character – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – protective custody
58.	<b>WONG</b> (18) <a href="#">[2010] NSWSC 171</a> Buddin J  Co-Offender: LEE	PG (20%) Murder  s.33	19y 6m NPP 14y  6y NPP 4y 6m  Total: 21y NPP 15y 6m		Minor – breached conditional liberty	Stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Followed three male Koreans from fast food restaurant after arranging to meet co-offender – approached victims and stabbed one male in chest – second male tripped while fleeing and struck by co-offender with hammer – stabbed by offender multiple times – claimed angered because first victim stared at him in fast food restaurant – slightly below mid-range Chinese parents – drug user causing hypersensitivity and paranoia

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
59.	<p><b>TATCHELL</b> (18)</p> <p><b>WILDSMITH</b> (20) <a href="#">[2010] NSWSC 495</a> Kirby J</p> <p>(Wildsmith) <a href="#">[2012] NSWCCA 116</a></p>	VG	<p>18y NPP 13y 6m</p> <p>16y NPP 12y</p>	AD	<p>Breached bail</p> <p>Breached bond for assault</p>	<p>Assault</p> <p>Intent GBH / joint criminal enterprise</p>	<p><b>SNPP 20 years</b> Victim fatally assaulted by group of youths – retaliation for victim’s abuse of ex-partner known to co-offenders – after discussion at fast food restaurant weapons collected at nearby house and victim assaulted while walking along road – opportunistic offence of short duration – metal pole, wooden axe handle and golf club used T – intent GBH – multiple blows with weapon – below mid-range – drug addiction / depression – some behaviour problems in custody - remorse W – not as involved – joint criminal enterprise aware possibility co-offender would use weapon to do grievous bodily harm – reluctant – supported Tatchell – assaulted in custody as result of offence – guarded prospects of rehabilitation Co offenders AA, SS and AC convicted of manslaughter</p>
60.	<p><b>LEE</b> (18) <a href="#">[2010] NSWSC 632</a> Price J</p> <p><a href="#">[2011] NSWCCA 169</a></p> <p>Co-offender: WONG</p>	<p>PG (12.5%)</p> <p>Sched: Assault s 61</p>	<p>19y 3m NPP 13y 3m</p>	<p>AA 17y 6m NPP 12y 3m</p>	Nil	<p>Stabbing</p> <p>Intent GBH</p>	<p><b>SNPP 20 years</b> With co-offender confronted victim and friends because thought victim had been “staring” – co-offender stabbed victim to heart – with co-offender chased victim – offender struck victim with hammer – co-offender inflicted more stab wounds – victim died from stab wound to heart - lesser role than co-offender. Remorse</p>
61.	<p><b>LUONG</b> (18) <a href="#">[2011] NSWSC 562</a> McCallum J</p> <p>Co-offender: TVN NGUYEN</p>	<p>PG (10%) 2 x Murder</p>	<p>24y NPP 17y</p> <p><u>Total</u> 28y NPP 21y</p>		Nil	<p>Stabbing</p> <p>Common purpose to inflict GBH</p>	<p><b>SNPP 20 years</b> Victims stabbed during attack by four males outside bar – not known who inflicted fatal wounds – attack a response to earlier attack on first offender by one victim and friends – delay between incidents and degree of planning – mid range offences – disregard for public safety L – stabbed both victims</p>

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
62.	<b>SHIELS</b> (20) <a href="#">[2011] NSWSC 1177</a> Barr AJ	VG	20y NPP 13y		Bonds for assaults including assault on victim – committed while mentally ill	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed father in temple during argument at party – both intoxicated - history of violent arguments with father – spontaneous offence – issue at trial was substantial impairment, provocation and self defence Suffering schizophrenia – regular user of marijuana and alcohol – voluntary surrender to police – remorse – prospects of rehabilitation
63.	<b>ATAI</b> (18) <a href="#">[2011] NSWSC 1617</a> Grove J  <a href="#">[2014] NSWCCA 210</a>	VG	24y NPP 18y	AD	Custodial record	Shooting  Recklessness	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Approached house with group of men – fired shots into front window of house killing occupant after being advised had wrong house – motive for approach to house and shooting unclear Afghani refugee with links to bikie gang
64.	<b>ISKANDAR</b> (19) <a href="#">[2012] NSWSC 149</a> Davies J  <a href="#">[2013] NSWCCA 235</a>  Co-offender: ISKANDAR	VG	25y NPP 18y	AA To backdate sentence	nil	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> With father took action against mother's lover – together waited for victim to return home – victim attacked in street by offender with hammer and stabbed by father with knife – left home that evening with father intending to kill victim Father somewhat dominating and controlling
65.	<b>KLEIN</b> (18) <a href="#">[2012] NSWSC 634</a> Mathews AJ  <a href="#">[2014] NSWCCA 29</a>  Co-offender MILAT	PG (CCA – 25%)	32y NPP 22y	AA 27y NPP 20y	No violence	Axe  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 25 years (for Klein only)</b> Offenders and another friend invited victim to accompany them to Belanglo Forest – M took double sided axe from vehicle and struck victim in torso and to back of head – killing recorded by K on mobile phone - “thrill kill” – planned and premeditated - in company - gratuitous cruelty. K – impressionable and strongly influenced by M - no psych illness - prospects of rehabilitation at least moderate and more favourable – within serious range
66.	<b>TAHA</b> (20) <a href="#">[2012] NSWSC 903</a> Latham J	VG	22y NPP 16y		nil	Stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Jealous and angry that girlfriend in car with victim and his girlfriend – armed with knives and gun – picked fight with victim who left car with intention to disarm offender – victim stabbed in heart - jury rejected self defence Offender intoxicated

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.



	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
67.	<b>AMOS</b> (20) <a href="#">[2012] NSWSC 1021</a> Hall J	VG	28y NPP 21y		Nil	Shooting  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Involved in armed robbery with co-offender of male drug dealer who owed money – formed intent to kill and shot victim eight times – returned to house with co-offender and stole property – victim shot in own home – only robbery planned – high level of culpability – committed for financial gain Deprived and neglected childhood
68.	<b>NATUBA</b> (19)     <b>TAMAPUA</b> (20) <a href="#">[2012] NSWSC 1569</a> Johnson J  Co-Offenders: MA BYQUAR RAMOS KHOURY KARIMI MIR	PG (50%) Murder  AR  Sched – Robbery  PG (50%) Murder  Sp Agg BES  Poss Firearm  Poss weapon  Sched:- 3 x Robbery	14y NPP 10y  5y NPP 3y 9m  <u>Total:</u> 15y NPP 11y  14y NPP 10y  4y NPP 3y  3y NPP 2y  FT 2y  <u>Total:</u> 15y 6m NPP 11y 6m		Agg robbery – breached bond.     Robbery, assault, breach AVO - on bond	Assault with meat cleaver / machete  Joint criminal enterprise	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Home invasions committed over three-day period with number of other young males - armed with meat cleavers - occupant at one home seriously injured - occupant of another house killed while resisting offenders N – threatened victim with cleaver T - organisational role – did not enter homes  Each received discount for assistance to authorities - undertaking to give evidence against co-accused - youth – drug and alcohol abuse

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.



	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
71.	<b>LOVERIDGE</b> (18) <a href="#">[2013] NSWSC 1591</a> Adams J  Co-offender: AB	VG Murder  PG s.112(3)  s.96  Recruit child to commit crime  Influence witness	45y NPP 30y  10y NPP 7y 6m  1y 8m NPP 1y 3m  FT 3y  FT 3y (all concurrent)		Minor record – breached bond	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Broke into neighbouring house at night – assaulted 87y female occupant with walking stick – made threats – stole property Premeditated and unprovoked attack on three male strangers walking down the street – L slashed knife against neck of one male – knocked second male to ground – 'cowardly, sadistic, pitiless, deadly attack, stabbing and cutting him repeatedly' – left scene then returned to continue assault – attack included intent to torture – both represent danger to community – worst case L – seriously deprived childhood affecting ability to make moral judgments – low intelligence – drug and alcohol abuse
72.	<b>MIR</b> (20) <a href="#">[2013] NSWSC 1761</a> Johnson J  <a href="#">[2022] NSWCCA 132</a>  Co-offenders: KARIMI KHOURY NATUBA TAMAPUA MA BYQUAR RAMOS	VG Murder  AR  AR	26y NPP 19y  10y NPP 7y  11y NPP 7y  <u>Total:</u> 31y NPP 24y	AD	Minor	Assault with meat cleavers  Joint criminal enterprise  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Home invasions committed over three-day period by young males armed with meat cleavers linked to drug dealing - occupant at one home seriously injured - occupant of another house killed with meat cleaver while resisting offenders – planned to engage subsequent fight to death Mir – foot soldiers - Afghani
73.	<b>E McKELLAR</b> (18) <a href="#">[2014] NSWSC 1243</a> RA Hulme J  Co-offender: B McKELLAR	VG Murder  Wound with intent  Att AR	20y NPP 14y  8y NPP 6y  5y NPP 3y 9m  <u>Total:</u> 24y NPP 18y		Lengthy – breached parole	Stabbing  Intent GBH  Extended joint criminal enterprise	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Four males attended home of victim with intent to rob – victim sold small amounts of cannabis on regular occasions – group brought machete and knife to scene - victim assaulted by BMcr at door to house – BMc pursued by victim and 17y son – son stabbed by EMc twice at request of BMc to 'kill the cunt' – victim surrounded and assaulted by four offenders – stabbed four times by EMc – spontaneous assault Aboriginal brothers with difficult background including domestic violence - very low intellectual functioning

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
74.	<b>M BARBIERI</b> (19) <a href="#">[2014] NSWSC 1808</a> Hulme J	PG (15% on appeal)  Sched: 4 offences	35y NPP 26y	AA 21y 3m NPP 15y	nil	Stabbing Intent to Kill	<b>SNPP 25 years</b> Male lived with mother on rural property - relationship with neighbour became antagonistic – fired crossbow at workers on neighbour's property – siege developed between police and offender and mother – attacked police with knife and sledgehammer – police officer fatally stabbed - mother was dominant offender Mother pleaded guilty to manslaughter Mother suffered serious mental illness causing paranoia and social isolation for both offenders – offender also developed serious mental illness - mandatory life sentence does not apply because of serious cognitive impairment
75.	<b>KENNEDY</b> (18) <a href="#">[2015] NSWSC 327</a> Wilson J  <a href="#">[2016] NSWCCA 114</a>  Co-offenders: SMITH SMITH	PG (5% on appeal)	21y NPP 15y 9m	Sentence AA 20y NPP 15y	Not as serious as co-offenders	Assault  Joint criminal enterprise / intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Three men broke into home of 75y male occupant – victim severely assaulted in attempt to obtain access to safe – left for nearly a day – moral culpability high but lower than co-offenders Drug addicted – aboriginal – exposed to drugs early - low intelligence – poor schooling
76.	<b>MAAKA</b> (18) <a href="#">[2015] NSWSC 358</a> RA Hulme J	PG (20%)  Sched: 16 offences	20y NPP 15y		BES, AOABH, Larceny	Assault  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Severe and violent attack upon 53y male homeowner during break in– struck victim and smashed drawer on victim's head - unbridled, gratuitous and extreme violence – acted with 2 co-offenders - affected by drugs - not planned or premeditated Disrupted upbringing – drug abuse
77.	<b>KELSALL</b> (20) <a href="#">[2015] NSWSC 480</a> RA Hulme J	VG Murder  Indecent assault	40y NPP 30y  FT 1y  Total: 40y 3m NPP 30y 3m	AD	nil	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Followed male stranger home late at night – entered through unlocked door – found male stranger in bedroom asleep or intoxicated – touched penis and stabbed multiple times (more than 20 wounds) – no motive although had previously reported thoughts of killing random stranger No remorse – questionable prospects of rehabilitation

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
78.	<b>WONG</b> (20) <a href="#">[2015] NSWSC 1612</a> RS Hulme AJ	VG	22y NPP 16y 6m		Nil	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> (2006) – student from Malaysia on visa – worked for male victim who owned restaurant – financial pressures – argument with victim over job termination and payment of wages – physical altercation - stabbed victim numerous times – took money and left for Malaysia – extradited to Australia in 2014. Good character – good prospects rehabilitation.
79.	<b>TOWNEY</b> (20) <a href="#">[2016] NSWSC 97</a> Fagan J  <a href="#">[2018] NSWCCA 65</a>	VG	24y NPP 18y	Conviction AD	Violence offences – breached bond and bail – gaol misconduct charges	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Engaged in fist fight with male acquaintance outside party at offender's house – retrieved knife from house and pursued victim who had left area on foot, stabbing him in neck several times – violent and spontaneous impulse Aboriginal – childhood of violence and deprivation – early drug abuse – some degree of remorse
80.	<b>FULLER</b> (18) <a href="#">[2016] NSWSC 815</a> Rothman J  <a href="#">[2017] NSWSC 1351</a> Rothman J  <a href="#">[2021] NSWCCA 194</a>	PG (not full 25%)  Sched: Add offences	24y 6m NPP 18y 4m	Conviction AD	Long record	Assault  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Believed victim owed offender money for stolen goods sold on behalf of offender – lured victim to meeting – punched victim twice then frenzied attack with blunt end of tomahawk – feared victim would report stolen goods to police Aboriginal with violent and abusive childhood - aggressive and psychopathic personality disorder
81.	<b>PERKINS</b> (18) <a href="#">[2016] NSWSC 1080</a> Button J  <a href="#">[2018] NSWCCA 62</a>	PG (10%)	20y 6m NPP 15y	AD	Nil	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Spent evening with girlfriend and female friend drinking and smoking cannabis – confrontation early in night with boyfriend of female friend – boyfriend returned later in evening and waited in car at request of girlfriend – offender found knife in kitchen and stabbed victim three times – victim in car restrained by seatbelt – no provocation – motivation unknown – formed intent shortly before offence Remorse – support of family – no history of substance abuse or mental illness

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
82.	<b>KADDOUR</b> (19 at offence – 23 at sentence) <a href="#">[2017] NSWSC 586</a> Mathews AJ	VG	20y NPP 15y		Minor	Assault  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Co-offender AZ pinched on bottom by male friend – probably gesture of friendship but AZ felt very insulted – offender, AZ and another co-offender attacked victim with various objects and a pole – suffered serious blunt force injuries - unprovoked attack – spontaneous rather than premeditated – mid-range Good prospects rehabilitation – youth - no remorse – drug abuse – supportive family and community – employed – well-regarded
83.	<b>BROOKS</b> (19) <a href="#">[2017] NSWSC 824</a> Hamill J	VG Murder  s.33	20y NPP 14y 6m  7y 6m NPP 5y  <u>Total:</u> 22y NPP 14y 6m		Nil	Stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed male stranger once to chest in altercation outside pizza place late at night – stabbed second male in chest twice – spontaneous offence – protective of brother who had been pushed to ground but no self-defence – carrying knife in public place – below mid-range Good prospects of rehabilitation – prior good character – some reduction for conduct of trial
84.	<b>MOTTRAM</b> (19) <a href="#">[2018] NSWSC 873</a> Hidden AJ	PG (25%)	18y NPP 13y 6m		nil	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> While staying with mother snapped – assaulted her with bottle then stabbed her multiple times including in face – suffering borderline personality disorder and substance induced psychosis – mother had history of mental illness resulting in difficult childhood and difficult relationship Remorse
85.	<b>AKOK</b> (19) <a href="#">[2019] NSWSC 1235</a> Button J	PG (25%)	16y NPP 12y		Armed robbery - assault with intent to rob - AOABH	Assault including broken bottle  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Fight with acquaintance following argument - attacked deceased with broken glass – grossly intoxicated – spontaneous offence Refugee background - grossly disrupted and deprived early years - mental illness – schizophrenia.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
86.	<b>HARWOOD</b> (19) <a href="#">[2019] NSWSC 1695</a> Walton J	PG (25%)	16y 6m NPP 12y		Nil	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed grandmother in her home during argument – spontaneous and unplanned offence – grew up with victim after being abandoned by mother – heavily intoxicated and emotionally distressed – slightly below mid-range Suffering borderline personality and depressive disorder – reduction of moral culpability and deterrence - complex and difficult relationship with grandmother and mother – no history of personal violence – youth – intoxication may partly explain loss of control – remorse – accepted responsibility – reasonably good prospects of rehabilitation
87.	<b>DONG</b> (19) <a href="#">[2020] NSWSC 1277</a> Hidden AJ  <a href="#">[2021] NSWCCA 82</a>	PG (25%)	18y NPP 13y 6m	Crown AA 21y NPP 15y 8m	Nil	Unknown  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Killed female flatmate in her own room and left body in gully beside major road – motive and method of killing unclear – some planning – considerable seriousness – aggravated by being in victim's home and disposal of body Long standing schizophrenia and subnormal intelligence of some bearing on moral culpability – difficult background – guarded prospects of rehabilitation – Chinese national – isolated and vulnerable in custody On appeal: SJ failed to consider protection of community
88.	<b>FLETCHER</b> (19 at offence / 21 at sentence) <a href="#">[2020] NSWSC 1478</a> RA Hulme  Co-offenders: GARVEY JONES	PG (35% combined)	15y NPP 11y 3m		Children's Court offences – affray	Machete / assault  Accessory	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Joint criminal enterprise – with two co-offenders targeted home invasion to steal drugs – co-offenders attacked victim with machete, knife and baseball bat – sustained vicious attack Reasonably good prospects of rehabilitation and of not reoffending – assistance – youth, immature, remorseful
89.	<b>BOTRUS (No.6)</b> (18) <a href="#">[2021] NSWSC 199</a> Walton J	VG	20y NPP 14y		On bail in Children's court.	Single stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed male victim seated at barber's - victim known to accused – “targeted” - victim had no warning of attack – single blow – planning, premeditation Substance abuse disorder – social disadvantage – tumultuous early childhood in Iraq – refugee background – remorse – rehabilitation

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
90.	<p><b>NEY</b> (20) <a href="#">[2021] NSWSC 529</a> Johnson J</p> <p><a href="#">[2023] NSWCCA 252</a></p>	<p>PG (10%) Murder</p> <p>s.33</p> <p>Sched: Assault Possess</p>	<p><u>Indicative:</u> 40y NPP 30y</p> <p>8y NPP 6y</p> <p><u>Aggregate:</u> 44y NPP 33y</p>	<p>AA <u>Indicative:</u> 36y NPP 27y</p> <p>8y NPP 6y</p> <p><u>Aggregate:</u> 40y NPP 30y</p>	Limited – breached conditional liberty – subsequent custodial offences	<p>Stabbed</p> <p>Intent to kill</p>	<p><b>SNPP 20 years</b> Travelled from home suburb to city with intent to kill - booked escort and upon arrival at unit fatally stabbed female victim, filmed scene and sent footage to friends – donned balaclava to engender fear and ran through city streets brandishing knife – attempted to stab one female then stabbed second female in shoulder – subdued by civilians – several days earlier had assaulted sister in family home during argument Turkish / Cypriot background – mental health issues since 14y but treatment resistant – at time of offending suffering mental disorder which did not impede capacity – no major depressive illness – obsessed with mass killings and violent, interactive fantasy games - dangerous man – importance of community protection – expressed desire to die at hands of police of limited mitigating value Declined to impose life sentence because of mental health issues – no double counting in setting determinate term On appeal: error found in failure to consider impact of mental health issues on custodial conditions</p>
91.	<p><b>HOPKINSON</b> (18y 10m)</p> <p><b>ROBERTSON</b> (18y 8m) <a href="#">[2021] NSWSC 861</a> Ierace J</p> <p><a href="#">[2022] NSWCCA 80</a></p>	<p>PG (25%)</p> <p>PG (45% combined)</p>	<p>12y 9m NPP 8y 3m</p> <p>13y 2m NPP 9y</p>	Crown AD	nil	<p>Assault / constructive / extended JCE</p> <p>Assault / intent to kill / JCE</p>	<p><b>SNPP 25 years</b> 17y victim detained in home of offenders over 8 hours – subjected to severe beating by co-accused S and fatally stabbed by S – offence aggravated by use of weapon and commission in company H watched assault and on several occasions took responsibility to keep victim detained – assisted in concealing offence – mid range seriousness R asleep during initial assault – later helped detain victim in car and assaulted victim to head with cricket bat to ‘put him out of his misery’ – non-exculpatory duress - above mid-range H – difficult childhood – some mental health issues – genuine remorse – very good prospects of rehabilitation R – unusually immature – high prospects of rehabilitation – genuine remorse – prior good character - assistance On appeal: sentences light but not manifestly inadequate – discussion as to SNPP where age gap between victim and offenders small</p>

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.



	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
92.	<b>TAUMALOLO</b> (18) <a href="#">[2021] NSWSC 1412</a> Davies J	PG	18y 10m NPP 14y 1m		Nil – dealt with for assaults on remand	Assault  Intent GBH  Joint criminal enterprise	<b>SNPP 20y</b> Group of youths fatally assaulted 18y male victim outside party – victim kicked, punched and stomped to head and face for several minutes while defenceless on ground – part of joint criminal enterprise to inflict GBH – did not know victim or reason for assault – vicious and unprovoked attack – spontaneous – gratuitous violence – main perpetrator – in company – under influence of drugs and alcohol – slightly below mid-range Some difficulties in childhood – low intellectual functioning – substance abuse since early teens – remorse – limited insight – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – low risk of re-offending – relevance of youth but also general deterrence Co-offenders sentenced for manslaughter and affray
93.	<b>MILLER (No.2)</b> (20) <a href="#">[2022] NSWSC 1347</a> Cavanagh J	VG	20y NPP 13y		Nil	Strangulation  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Assaulted and strangled 18y female partner while suffering delusion he was being attacked by a demon – not intoxicated but suffering temporary effect of LSD taken 11 days prior – spontaneous offence well below mid-range and towards lower end – moral culpability reduced Prior good character – remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation – assistance with administration of justice – no history of psychotic episodes
94.	<b>ERDOGAN</b> (19 at offence; 23 at sentence) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 101</a> Ierace J	VG	35y NPP 24y		Larceny, common assault, driving, contravening ADVO. On bail.	Assault and stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 25 years</b> With 2 co-offenders - instigated murder of 17y male - assaulted over approximately two hours - motive for assaults, until time of intention to kill, was anger towards victim since earlier argument - tortured over extended period and repeatedly stabbed – hit to head with cricket bat or wrench and kicking or stomping - stabbed in neck area 22 times, snapping blade of knife – degree of premeditation. No remorse - guarded prospects rehabilitation - violence and fact and mode of killing of remain essentially unexplained behaviour – ADHD - long-standing mental health issues sufficiently serious to destabilise education and functioning in society.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
95.	<b>KOVALEFF</b> (19) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 302</a> Rothman J	PG (15%) Murder  Wound with intent cause GBH	34y NPP 24y  6y 9m NPP 4y 9m  <u>Total:</u> 36y NPP 26y			Stabbed  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 25y</b> Stabbed 17y female and wounded 17y girlfriend – previously told girlfriend he wanted to kill her – attended hotel room with both victims intending to kill girlfriend – premeditated and planned two murders – wrapped girlfriend with her clothing and duct tape to keep her alive so as to have sex with her – rang and told father he had stabbed victims Motive elusive - feigned psychiatric illness for two years - impossible to find offender suffers personality disorder - no psychosis or sexual disorder – pathological interest in Ted Bundy, serial killer - borderline intellectual capacity
96.	<b>AA (a pseudonym)</b> (18) <a href="#">[2024] NSWSC 409</a> Huggett SCJ	PG (25%)  Sched: Use offensive weapon with intent to intimidate	12y 3m NPP 8y		Assault, AOABH, receiving, driving unlicensed	Suffocate  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 25y</b> Female - young mother suffocated 11-month-old baby daughter - precise mechanism of suffocation not known - no other violence, neglect or abuse - volatile relationship with child's father - irrational motive that her conduct would lead to resumption of relationship with child's father – belief arose from post-traumatic stress disorder and personality disorder existing at time of offence. Intent to kill but intention formed impulsively, without planning and fleeting - mental health impairments closely connected to offending that objective seriousness reduced. Traumatic background – remorse – positive rehabilitation prospects - special circumstances.
97.	<b>DAWSON</b> (19) <a href="#">[2024] NSWSC 846</a> RA Hulme AJ  Co-offenders SIONE [2024] BE [2023] BL [2024] AD [2024]	VG	20y NPP 13y		Record – breached conditional liberty	Assault  Accessory liability	<b>SNPP 25 years</b> 16y male bashed by group over 33 minutes – victim accused by D of stealing airpods so lured to her home – assault in bedroom initiated by adult offender S and continued by other male juvenile offenders – D encouraged assault by presence, words and filming – frenzied assault involving extreme violence on vulnerable and defenceless victim – liability based on extended joint criminal enterprise to detain and assault foreseeing possibility of intentional GBH Female - significant cognitive impairment reducing moral culpability – behavioural and mental health issues – difficult childhood– onerous custodial conditions – genuine remorse – special circumstances TB [2024] sentenced for manslaughter

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
98.	AYLWARD (18) <a href="#">[2024] NSWSC 923</a> Wilson J	PG (25%)	18y NPP 12y		nil	Stabbed  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 25 years</b> Offender entered home of 17y male acquaintance late at night and fatally stabbed victim asleep in bed – had been told by family member victim had physically hurt her on earlier occasion – 12 stab wounds to head and upper torso – savage attack - some element of planning Childhood marred by physical, sexual and drug abuse – youth, immaturity and PTSD – reduction in moral culpability under <i>Bugmy</i> – physical health conditions – remorse - out of character

Last Updated: Aug 2024

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.