

<h2 style="margin: 0;">Murder</h2> <h3 style="margin: 0;">Victims Under 18 years – Since 2000</h3>

Maximum Penalty: Life (s.19A (NSW) Crimes Act)

Standard non-parole period (offences committed on or after 1.2.2003)

20 years

Standard non-parole period (where conviction entered or plea of guilty made on or after 1.1.2008)

25 years - Where the victim a child under 18 years of age

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
1.	DE GRUCHY (2000) 110 A Crim R 271 [2000] NSWCCA 51	VG 3 x murder	MT 21y AT 7y (concurrent)	Conviction AD		assaulted with heavy weapons	Killed mother, sister and brother in home - no motive for killings.
2.	PARK (30) NSWSC 3.8.2000 Sperling J [2003] NSWCCA 203 [2003] NSWCCA 142	VG Murder Murder Murder	26y NPP 19y 6m FT 15y FT 15y (concurrent)	Conviction AD Crown AD		suffocation intent kill	Suffocated wife and two infant children and dumped bodies in bushland - highly charged emotional state at time of killing. Some remorse - admissions shortened trial - protective custody
3.	O'GRADY (16y 9m) [2000] NSWSC 1255 Hulme J	VG	15y NPP 10y		no significant record	shooting	Led 15y male acquaintance into bush area and shot with rifle and silencer 9 times - voluntarily surrendered to police - no rational explanation for offence. Displayed genuine remorse and shame - long history of drug abuse - desensitised to violence but no actual history of violence - impulsive - degree of depersonalisation at time of offence - general deterrence limited value

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
4.	CIKOS [2001] NSWSC 35 Dunford J	PG (10-15%) 3 x Murder	21y NPP 15y 6m (concurrent)		nil	suffocation / assault intent to kill	Killed de facto and sons aged 4 years and 18 months old - passive man who endured months of aggression and abuse at hands of dominant de facto wife - reacted to de facto's ultimatum that he kill de facto's friend by certain date. Genuine remorse - strict protection
5.	MCINTYRE (44) [2001] NSWSC 500 Bell J [2002] NSWCCA 29	VG	22y NPP 17y	AD	negligible	stabbing intent to kill	Stabbed 14y boy in neck and chest - disposed of body in bushland after cutting off penis and scrotum and attempting to saw off leg - motive unclear - not premeditated. Socially isolated lifestyle - family support.
6.	CHEATHAM [2001] NSWSC 580 Grove J [2002] NSWCCA 360	VG Murder Murder Wound w/i to murder	24y NPP 16y FT 16y FT 12y (concurrent)	AA 22y NPP 14y FT 14y FT 12y (concurrent)		stabbing	Stabbed wife and 3y daughter to death and attempted to stab baby to death - believed he was suffering from AIDS and had infected family. Protective custody because worked in juvenile justice system - retrial
7.	SLD (13y 10m) [2002] NSWSC 758 Wood CJ at CL (2003) 142 A Crim R 503 [2003] NSWCCA 310	PG	20y NPP 10y	AD		stabbing intent to kill	Broke into neighbouring home at night and abducted 3y sleeping girl - removed clothes and stabbed her in chest once - discarded body in long grass - misled police during inquiries - callous and cold-blooded killing - motive unclear. Seriously affected by background of upheaval, abuse and lack of emotional support - intellectual and speech disability and dysmorphic appearance - sexually abused by half-brother - disturbed individual - history of aggressive and unacceptable behaviour - significant level of future dangerousness, although difficult to assess at this stage
8.	MERRITT (30) [2002] NSWSC 1159 Greg James J (2004) 146 A Crim R 309 [2004] NSWCCA 19	PG (15% on appeal) 2 x Murder Murder	Life	AA 24y NPP 18y 24y NPP 17y Total: 34y NPP 27y	minor	suffocation intent to kill	Father killed his 3 children aged 11w, 11m and 6y on custody visit - no explanation for killing - incomprehensible action - no evidence of mental disorder. On appeal: objective gravity of offence justified life sentence but insufficient weight given to depressive state - sentence patterns show life not imposed in cases of parents murdering children.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
9.	FOLBIGG (36) [2003] NSWSC 895 Barr J (2005) 152 A Crim R 35 [2005] NSWCCA 23 [2007] NSWCCA 371 [2023] NSWCCA 325	VG Murder Murder Murder Manslaughter Intentionally inflict GBH	18y 20y 22y NPP 12y FT 10y FT 14y <u>Total:</u> 40y NPP 30y	Sentence AA 18y 20y 22y NPP 17y FT 10y FT 14y <u>Total:</u> 30y NPP 25y	Nil Conviction AD Conviction AA Convictions quashed – acquittals entered	Suffocation Intent to kill	Mother killed four babies over ten years – suffocated each child in spontaneous burst of anger – earlier attack on second child caused blindness Seriously psychologically damaged by early neglect and physical and sexual abuse – protective custody On sentence appeal: error in accumulation and overall sentence crushing – comments on public opinion NOTE: Ms Folbigg received a pardon for all offences in 2023 after a Part 7 <i>Crimes (Appeal and Review) Act</i> inquiry found a reasonable doubt as to her guilt. Following this inquiry the CCA found reasonable doubt as to guilt in light of scientific evidence not available at the time of the trial - convictions were quashed and verdicts of acquittal entered on all counts
10.	FRASER (36) [2004] NSWSC 53 Howie J [2005] NSWCCA 77	VG 3 x Murder	32y NPP 27y	AD	Nil	Drowning Intent to kill	Drugged daughter and 2 sons with sleeping tablets then drowned them in bath – daughter violently struggled – revenge against estranged wife – genuine attempt at suicide – premeditated and planned offences Severely mentally disturbed at time – history of mental illness – protective custody
11.	JSK (16y) [2004] NSWSC 470 Buddin J Co-offender: MAH	PG	11y NPP 7y		Nil	Assault Intent to kill	Fatal assault on 17y friend at instigation of co-offender – friend taken to remote area and body buried – pre-meditation – element of duress. Voluntary admission of guilt three years later - significant discount for assistance – extreme remorse – emotionally immature – excellent prospects of rehabilitation

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
12.	MS (17) [2004] NSWSC 730 Dunford J	VG	17y NPP 11y		Lengthy record including common assault and mal wounding	Strangulation Intent to kill	Killed 15y girlfriend by strangling her with shoelaces – relationship marked by violence towards victim Aboriginal – physically abused and dislocated throughout childhood – alcohol and drug addiction – good prospects of rehabilitation
13.	VANN (20) [2004] NSWSC 988 Dunford J	PG (13%) Murder Assault	19y NPP 14y 3m FT 18m (concurrent)		Possess knife in public place	Shooting Intent to kill	Shot 16y male stranger with SKS rifle during fight outside cinema – called to cinema to assist
14.	O'CONNELL (18) [2004] NSWSC 1120 Davidson AJ [2006] NSWCCA 82	PG (20%)	35y NPP 25y	AD	Juvenile record for serious crimes of violence	Assault and stabbing Intent to kill	Killed 15y girl with whom he was having casual relationship – horrific wounds – 49 injuries, including 10 stab wounds - violent sexual proclivities – disposed of body in nearby garbage bin – deliberately attempted to divert suspicion Victim of abuse by stepfathers – drug and alcohol problems – dyslexia/ADHD – remorse – youth – but for youth and plea, life sentence would have been imposed – limited protective custody
15.	COULTER (41) [2005] NSWSC 101 G. James J	PG	Life		Nil	Suffocation intent to kill	SNPP 20 years Killed 11y daughter of cousin – planned to kill so would be forced to commit suicide – smothered victim in her home – took body to bushland and grossly mutilated body before genuine attempt at suicide – carefully planned Suffering severe depression, pervasive and intrusive violent thoughts and obsessive compulsive disorder – lifelong mental disorder
16.	MAH (17y 10m - 22 at sentence) [2005] NSWSC 871 Hislop J [2006] NSWCCA 226 Co-offender: JSK	VG	22y NPP 16y 6m	Crown AD / AD	neg driving	Assault Intent to kill	Fatal assault on 17y friend - principal - friend taken to remote area and body buried – pre-meditation Good employment history – supportive family – denies all involvement

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
17.	JALATY (30-31) [2006] NSWSC 675 Grove J	VG Murder Mal Admin noxious thing	20y NPP 15y FT 5y (concurrent)		Not relevant	Ingestion of methadone Reckless indifference	SNPP 20 years Female dosed 3y daughter with methadone causing cardiac respiratory arrest – 3 months later dosed daughter again causing death – attempting to control behaviour and keep child asleep during liaison with male friend Difficult life with rape, forced marriages and serious back injuries from car accident – acute loneliness – drug addiction from back injuries – protective custody – chronic back pain
18.	F.A.P (24) [2007] NSWSC 905 Howie J	PG (10%)	19y 6m NPP 14y 6m		Record	Assault Intent GBH	SNPP 20 years Caused fatal head injury to 15m son – admitted abusing son physically over week preceding death – frustrated by victim's crying and behaviour – unplanned offence – slightly below mid-range of seriousness Aboriginal with deprived and troubled upbringing – immature and low intellectual ability
19.	DN (24) [2007] NSWSC 1252 Hidden J	PG (20%) Murder Att murder	20y NPP 15y 12y NPP 8y <u>Total</u> 25y NPP 20y		Nil	Stabbing	SNPP 20 years Stabbed partner in face – fatally stabbed 11y step son – no explanation for uncharacteristic attack or violent rage – intoxicated and suffering cannabis withdrawal and depression – above mid- range Aboriginal with no history for violence – deep remorse
20.	RHB (25 / 37 at offences - 41 at sentence) [2007] NSWSC 1466 Hall J (2008) 189 A Crim R 178 [2008] NSWCCA 236	VG Manslaughter Murder	6y NPP 4y 6m 30y NPP 20y <u>Total:</u> 34y 6m NPP 24y 6m	Crown AD AA 6y NPP 4y 6m 26y 8m NPP 20y <u>Total:</u> 31y 2m NPP 24y 6m	Minor – no violence	Assault Either intent to kill or GBH	SNPP 20 years Killed 14m step son – traumatic injuries to head – circumstances of killing unclear – 12y later killed 2y son of sister in law – traumatic head injury – circumstances unclear – both children in care of offender – unlawful and dangerous act manslaughter

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
21.	DL (16) [2008] NSWSC 1199 Hulme J [2017] NSWCCA 58 [2018] HCA 32 [2018] NSWCCA 302	VG	22y NPP 17y	AD HCA Sentence AA Remitted for re-sentence 18y NPP 13y	Nil	Stabbing Intent GBH	SNPP 25years Stabbed 15y school girl walking home from school 48 times – frenzied killing – no explanation for attack – irrational – premeditation not established – intent to kill not established – uncharacteristic – possible psychotic episode – little below mid-range Suffering anxiety and depression – declined to discuss offence claiming innocence
22.	PJS (33) [2009] NSWSC 153 Mathews AJ	VG	26y NPP 20y		Lengthy record – breached bonds	Assault	SNPP 25 years Severe assault of 3y step daughter left at home with offender and 9y sister when mother went to refuge – assaulted all over head and body – intoxicated – no recollection – position of trust – above mid-range Violent childhood – protective custody – violent relationship with wife
23.	WALSH (69) [2009] NSWSC 764 McCallum J	PG 2 x Murder Murder Att murder	Life 20y NPP 15y 16y NPP 12y		Nil	Assault, stabbing and drowning Intent to kill	SNPP 20 years / 25 years Grandfather hit wife with hammer and stabbed her to death – drowned 5y granddaughter in bath – assaulted 7y grandson with hammer then drowned in bath – bodies placed in bed – killed dog – children in care of grandparents while mother at work – lied to school about children being ill – assaulted daughter with axe when she returned– brain and skull injuries – planning and premeditation – high degree of violence - no explanation for killings – murder of wife mid-range – assault on daughter well above mid-range No mental illness
24.	MEHTA (42) [2009] NSWSC 814 Grove J	PG Murder Murder	30y Life		Assault on first wife – strangling and threat to kill	Strangulation Intent to kill	SNPP 20 years / 25 years Strangled wife during argument – verbal threats and physical assaults made previously – killed 9y step daughter to prevent her reporting killing to police – method of killing unclear – threw bodies over cliff in Blue Mountains – discovered by bushwalkers four weeks later – lied to police – had son assist in deception - killed wife for financial reasons No evidence of remorse or rehabilitation

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
25.	SW (No 3) (34) [2009] NSWSC 1043 Hulme J [2013] NSWCCA 103	VG	Life	AA 40y NPP 30y	Nil	Starvation – neglect	SNPP 25 years Mother of 7y daughter who died as a result of starvation and neglect – daughter suffered developmental delay and autism – left in bedroom in unhygienic conditions - worst case Drug use – difficult personal history including possible domestic abuse within relationships – expert psychiatric evidence identified abnormal personality traits Father [BW] sentenced for manslaughter. On appeal: in view of expert psychiatric evidence did not come in worst case category
26.	DENNIS (19) [2009] NSWSC 1357 Barr AJ [2012] NSWCCA 120 [2015] NSWCCA 61	VG	26y 8m NPP 20y	Conviction AD Sentence AD	Nil	Assault Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Assaulted 23m son of girlfriend while in his care – hit head with blunt instrument or forced head against wall – placed child back in cot – spontaneous offence – circumstances of offence unclear Exemplary character – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – protective custody
27.	PFITZNER (26) [2009] NSWSC 1267 RA Hulme J [2010] NSWCCA 314	PG (15%)	25y 6m NPP 19y 2m	AD	Breached suspended sentence for mal inflict GBH in company – other offences	Asphyxiation Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Female - mistreated, abused and assaulted 2y son over long period of time – murdered victim by asphyxiation although actual method of killing unclear – wrapped body in plastic, placed in suitcase and threw in nearby pond – spontaneous offence giving in to anger and influenced by several factors and pressures – had declined to give up victim to custody of mother or DOCS despite asking for help – aware victim about to be returned to lawful guardian - slightly below mid-range. Displayed appropriate parenting to two other children
28.	LANE (21 at offence - 36 at sentence) [2011] NSWSC 289 Whealy J [2013] NSWCCA 317	VG Murder 3 x False swearing	18y NPP 13y 5m 9m (concurrent)	Conviction AD	nil	Unknown Intent to kill	(1996) Mother disposed of 2-day old daughter – body never found and no information as to circumstances of or motive for killing – killing relatively spontaneous – suffering disordered personality - false swearing offences related to false information contained in affidavits used for adoption of other children – birth of daughter and two other children kept secret from friends and family Strong character testimonials – rehabilitation – mother to 9y daughter – low level of protective custody

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
29.	DA-PRA (48) [2012] NSWSC 607 RS Hulme J [2014] NSWCCA 211	VG Murder Attempt murder (Mansl at first instance)	15y NPP 10y 6y NPP 4y 6m 6y NPP 4y 6m <u>Total</u> 20y NPP 15y	Conviction AA Crown AA 20y NPP 13y 10y NPP 7y 6m <u>Total</u> 25y NPP 19y	Nil	Stabbed	SNPP 20 years / 25 years Suffocated father (manslaughter) – believed bikies were after him causing argument with father - ran next door to neighbours' home - attacked 12y female cutting her throat (murder) – also attacked mother and cut her throat (attempt murder) - unclear why attacked neighbours – did not attend house with intent to kill Schizophrenia - chronic cannabis use – no prior violence – reliable employee – remorse – attempted suicide – no possibility of reoffending On appeal: manslaughter quashed on grounds of mental illness
30.	MILAT (17) KLEIN (18) [2012] NSWSC 634 Mathews AJ [2014] NSWCCA 29	PG (No discount) PG (CCA – 25%)	43y NPP 30y 32y NPP 22y	AD AA 27y NPP 20y	Mid-range PCA No violence	Axe Intent to kill	SNPP 25 years (for Klein only) Offenders and another friend invited victim to accompany them to Belanglo Forest – M took double sided axe from vehicle and struck victim in torso and to back of head – killing recorded by K on mobile phone - “thrill kill” – planned and premeditated - in company - gratuitous cruelty. M - personality dysfunctions and lack of empathy - poses substantial risk of violent re-offending - serious potential danger to community – no remorse – worst case category murder K – impressionable and strongly influenced by M - no psych illness - prospects of rehabilitation at least moderate and more favourable – within serious range
31.	ABRAHAMS (27) [2013] NSWSC 952 Harrison J	PG (10%) Murder Interference with body	21y 6m NPP 15y FT 18m <u>Total:</u> 22y 6m NPP 16y		Personal violence order against victim	Assault Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Female - murder of 6y daughter – in 2010 reported daughter missing – in 2011 took police to gravesite with partner - victim suffered repeated injuries in months prior to death – fractured teeth just prior to death suggesting blunt force trauma and being punched in upward direction – offender and partner had placed body in suitcase then placed in hole in remote area – partner poured petrol over body and burnt it - mid-range objective seriousness. Borderline disabled intellectual range – dysfunctional and disruptive upbringing – upbringing in violent household – Aboriginal background. Partner sentenced for manslaughter - <u>Smith</u> [2013] NSWSC 796 per Latham J

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
32.	MBELE (22) [2013] NSWSC 1394 Latham J [2021] NSWCCA 182	VG	26y NPP 18y	AA 23y NPP 16y	Breached bond for assault	Stabbing Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Stabbed 16y during confrontation at railway station in early evening – earlier confrontation with victim – members of opposing groups – angry – deliberately antagonised victim to provoke confrontation – single stab to chest – ‘cowardly, vicious, vengeful and premeditated attack’ On appeal found error in failing to consider impact of PTSD on custodial conditions On re-sentence – negative impact of PTSD and Covid on custodial conditions – limited treatment for PTSD – remorse – better prospects of rehabilitation – continued family support
33.	BELL (27) [2013] NSWSC 1838 Hall J	PG (10%) Murder s97(2) s33(1)(a)	25y 4m NPP 19y 5y NPP 3y 9m 10y NPP 7y 6m <u>Total:</u> 27y NPP 21y 6m		Rob in co, AOABH, drugs	Shooting Constructive murder	SNPP 20 years Home invasion with co-offender to obtain money and drugs – armed with firearms – during struggle accidentally shot in face by co-offender – offender discharged his firearm killing male aged 17y – co-offender shot and injured second male - intent to inflict injury for purpose of effecting escape - did not form intent to shoot until very shortly before fatal shot fired Left school Year 8 – learning difficulties - long standing personal problems including drug use and anti-social personality characteristics - no link established between anti-social personality disorder and any abusive or deprived upbringing
34.	FAZAH (32) [2014] NSWSC 231 Hidden J	PG (25%) Murder s.33	24y NPP 18y 7y NPP 5y <u>Total:</u> 26y NPP 20y		nil	Stabbing Intent to kill	SNPP 25 years After assaulting wife in unit chased her down stairs and stabbed her multiple times – returned to unit and fatally stabbed 2y daughter – offender stabbed himself – spontaneous offence Troubled relationship – history of violence towards wife – suffered wartime conditions, capture and torture in Afghanistan – PTSD – custodial conditions more onerous because of personal history

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
35.	ROSS (29) [2014] NSWSC 707 Rothman J [2016] NSWCCA 176	VG	40y NPP 30y	AD	BES - assault	Assault Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Killed 2y daughter of de facto- mistreated child during two months prior to death – forced her into cold shower and hit her head against shower screen – kicked collapsed child forcing her head to hit linen cupboard – injured child left in pram unattended for night and day – unplanned and unpremeditated Bipolar disorder and high-level personality disorder – heavy smoker of cannabis – difficult childhood – aboriginal but no relevant Fernando considerations – no remorse
36.	HILL (33) [2014] NSWSC 1010 Bellew J	PG (10%)	27y 6m NPP 20y 6m		nil	Assault Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Killed 2y son of de facto – physically abused victim over many months – fractured skull and gastric tear caused by two separate blows – significant force used – would have been aware of pain caused by first blow to stomach – second blow inflicted several hours later – spontaneous and unplanned – slightly above mid-range Back injuries causing persistent pain - depression
37.	McARTHUR [2014] NSWSC 1401 Harrison J	PG (10%)	25y 2m NPP 18y 10m			Stabbing Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Stabbed 15y male outside industrial premises – mistook victim for his father – offender made an offer by a 'mate' to 'rough up' and assault person who owed money – would be paid in drugs – had never seen victim or his father before – stabbed victim to chest – planned offence – armed with weapon - above mid-range. Drug user Co-Accused Robertson sentenced for manslaughter
38.	SB (16) AE (16) [2015] NSWSC 659 Hall J (AE) [2016] NSWCCA 228	VG VG	12y NPP 8y 12y NPP 8y	 Conviction AD	Nil Nil	Assault Joint criminal enterprise	Part of group of males involved in bashing and fatal assault of 17y male at party – group kicked and bashed victim – struck on head by co-offender JP with wine bottle causing death. Each offender had favourable rehabilitation and strong subjective circumstances.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
39.	MAYBIR (No.8) (29) [2016] NSWSC 166 RA Hulme J	VG Murder s.61O(2A) 5 x s.61 2 x s.91H(2) s.35(3) s.59(1)	<u>Indicative</u> 38y NPP 28y 6m 1y 2y / 1y / 1y 3m 2y / 1y 4y NPP 3y 1y <u>Aggregate</u> 42y NPP 31y 6m		Breached bond imposed for breaching AVO	Assault Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Lived with partner and her young children in small music studio – enforced physical discipline over many months particularly on 7y male victim suffering intellectual disability – cruel, degrading and inhumane treatment – victim died as result of blunt force trauma to head although exact manner of death unclear – failed to obtain medical treatment
40.	XIE (53) [2017] NSWSC 63 Fullerton J [2021] NSWCCA 1	VG 5 x Murder	Life	Conviction AD		Assault with hammer-like weapon Intent to kill	SNPP 20 years / 25 years Killed wife's brother and his wife, her sister and their 12y and 9y sons and wife's sister – all victims killed in same house at night – severe and targeted assault to heads and faces of victims with hammer-like weapon - attached rope to weapon to maximise degree of force and ensure victims killed with speed and efficiency – planning – possible motive of sexual interest in 15y daughter of victim (not present in house on night of killing) or upset with low status in family - spread and severity of injuries - multiple forms of extreme violence Risk of future violent offending amplified by sexual violence inflicted on victims' daughter after murders

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
41.	RHODES (35) [2017] NSWSC 964 Campbell J	PG (25%) Murder Murder Assault Assault police Sched: Property damage Resist arrest	<u>Indicative</u> 24y NPP 18y 30y NPP 22y 6m 14m 2y <u>Total:</u> 40y NPP 30y		Violence against mother	Assault and stabbing Intent to kill	SNPP 20 years / SNPP 25 years Returned home after drinking and using drugs during day – ice-induced psychosis – chased mother out of house stabbing her multiple times then crushing skull with concrete statue – returned to house and stabbed young male relative in chest with knife – threw him against wall and chased him outside smashing his head with sandstone paver – sustained and persistent although spontaneous assaults – approached and threatened female stranger in her car – threatened male police officer with fibro-cement meter cover – offences conducted in presence of other young children – home of victims – abuse of trust – well above midrange offences Aboriginal with abusive father – long history of drug addictions – suffering ADHD and dyslexia resulting in easy recourse to violence when angry – some remorse
42.	LOCK (TL) (27) [2017] NSWSC 715 Latham J [2020] NSWCCA 265	VG	36y NPP 27y	AD	Minor	Assault Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Bashed 2y child of de facto partner - blunt force trauma caused massive internal bleeding leading to death – history of assaults on victim - more than moderately above mid-range
43.	LN (40) AW (45) [2017] NSWSC 1387 Johnson J (LN) [2020] NSWCCA 131	VG VG	44y NPP 33y 40y NPP 30y	AA 38y NPP 28y 6m	Nil limited	Assault Intent to kill (LN) Accessory (AW)	SNPP 25 years LN mother of 3y male victim - AW stepfather and LN's partner - LN killed child – AW guilty by extended joint criminal enterprise – victim assaulted over 51-day period before murder – extensive emotional and physical abuse – fatal injuries committed by LN attacking victim - substantial acceleration/deceleration forces - pattern of assaults taken into consideration in assessing objective seriousness LN: objective seriousness very significantly above mid-range – mental illness - troubled background - drug and alcohol abuse – no insight into offence – no remorse or contrition AW: objective seriousness significantly above mid-range - no remorse or contrition CCA (LN): error in relation to effect of offender's mental illness on moral culpability

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
44.	TERKMANI (21) [2017] NSWSC 1567 McCallum J	VG Murder s.61J	<u>Indicative</u> 40y NPP 30y 20y NPP 15y <u>Aggregate</u> 45y NPP 33y		Numerous offences involving unprovoked violence – breached strict bail conditions for serious drug offences	Assault Intent to kill	SNPP 25 years Bashed to death 16y male friend in abandoned house – sustained, brutal and horrific attack using variety of household items as weapons – strangled victim – repeatedly thrust handle of squeegee into anus as far as stomach wall – offences appear spontaneous – motive impossible to discern Offences extreme enough to warrant maximum penalty but declined to impose life sentence due to youth
45.	JK (31) [2018] NSWSC 250 Hamill J	PG (slightly more than 10%) Murder Sched: Inflict GBH	37y 6m NPP 28y		Minor	Assault Intent to GBH	SNPP 25 years Killing of 12y step-daughter following sustained beatings over several days – horrific injuries through blunt force trauma – history of regular and increasingly violent assaults - tied to garage beam by hands and hit with electric cord, slapping, punching - tied to bed and whipped – torture – gratuitous cruelty – use of weapon - absence of intent to kill did not take case outside “worst case” Insight and remorse demonstrated - longstanding depression
46.	CLIFF (No.6) (29) [2018] NSWSC 587 Campbell J [2023] NSWCCA 15	VG Murder PG Agg BES Stealing	30y NPP 22y 3y 1y <u>Total:</u> 32y NPP 24y	Conviction AD	Not serious - property, driving, assault	Stabbing Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Killed 16y brother of ex-partner during argument – offender upset by victim’s remarks concerning breakup and property settlement with victim’s sister – intoxicated by ice/methamphetamine – did not know killed victim until informed by police some hours later - unlikely intent to kill – large number of injuries by knife and blunt force trauma including blow to top of victim’s head – one fatal deep stab wound to area around heart - mid-range Ongoing drug abuse – depressive symptoms

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
47.	HOLDEM (34 at offence – 44 at sentence) [2018] NSWSC 1677 RA Hulme J	PG 2 x Murder	Life		includes assault and child sexual assault	Assault / Suffocation Intent to kill	SNPP 20 years / 25 years Male travelled with 20y female and her 2y daughter from Northern Territory – took adult victim to Belangalo Forest and murdered her by stomping or leaning on chest and throat – motive for killing unclear – complete disdain for victim as human being - sexually abused victim at time or shortly after death and took photos – took victim’s daughter and suffocated her en route back to Northern Territory – dumped body in suitcase by side of road – planned to sexually assault child although not clear if this occurred – prompted in part by need to cover up killing of mother - bodies remained unidentified for many years – sent phone messages to victim’s mother and accessed victim’s bank account for several years – level of culpability so extreme Abusive childhood – regular drug user – actions show danger to community
48.	KHAZMA (23) [2019] NSWSC 416 Fullerton J	VG Murder AOABH AOABH	40y NPP 30y FT 3y FT 5y <u>Aggregate</u> 44y NPP 33y		juvenile record	Assault Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Killed daughter of de facto partner aged 2y 8m – blunt force head and spinal cord injuries – slammed victim’s head into wall – next day slapped victim forcing head to hit floor – shook unconscious child with sufficient force to cause further injuries – post mortem revealed 114 inflicted injuries on almost every area of victim’s body, including soles of feet - 45 separate sites of bruising, 17 thermal injuries including to perianal area and 28 probable human bite marks – majority of injuries inflicted by offender – uncontrolled rage and lack of appreciation of vulnerability of child Nothing in subjective features provides possible explanation for conduct
49.	WHITELEY (26) [2021] NSWSC 153 Rothman J	VG	35y NPP 24y		Extremely limited	Assault Intent GBH	SNPP 25 years Killed 20mth step daughter – 13 injuries to neck and head and 16 injuries to trunk – assault probably started while child in her bed and included being thrown against drawers – spontaneous assault over several minutes with no motive – assault reflected emotional dysfunction related to mental and personality disorder – breach of trust - above mid-range Sexually abused and mistreated as a child – mental health and personality disorder – some remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation – some reduction for conduct of trial

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
50.	<p>HOPKINSON (18y 10m)</p> <p>ROBERTSON (18y 8m)</p> <p>[2021] NSWSC 861 Ierace J</p> <p>[2022] NSWCCA 80</p>	<p>PG (25%)</p> <p>PG (45% combined)</p>	<p>12y 9m NPP 8y 3m</p> <p>13y 2m NPP 9y</p>	Crown AD	nil	<p>Assault / constructive / extended JCE</p> <p>Assault / intent to kill / JCE</p>	<p>SNPP 25 years 17y victim detained in home of offenders over 8 hours – subjected to severe beating by co-accused S and fatally stabbed by S – offence aggravated by use of weapon and commission in company H watched assault and on several occasions took responsibility to keep victim detained – assisted in concealing offence – mid range seriousness R asleep during initial assault – later helped detain victim in car and assaulted victim to head with cricket bat to ‘put him out of his misery’ – non-exculpatory duress - above mid-range H – difficult childhood – some mental health issues – genuine remorse – very good prospects of rehabilitation R – unusually immature – high prospects of rehabilitation – genuine remorse – prior good character - assistance On appeal: sentences light but not manifestly inadequate – discussion as to SNPP where age gap between victim and offenders small</p>
51.	<p>NB (45)</p> <p>[2022] NSWSC 1013 Cavanagh J</p>	VG	26y 6m NPP 18y (5%)		Nil	<p>Assault</p> <p>Intent GBH</p>	<p>SNPP 25 years Female – Foster carer - caring for deceased, child / baby aged 20 months – violent assault – loss of control - forceful blow to stomach –fracture of left femur, stomach perforation, bruising, scratch marks. Unusual case - no pattern of mistreatment leading up to child’s death / no violence over lengthy period. Prior good character - unlikely to reoffend - reduction for facilitating administration of justice - special circumstances.</p>
52.	<p>SHERIDAN (No.2) (24)</p> <p>[2022] NSWSC 1634 Garling J</p>	VG	25y NPP 17y		Drugs, driving, common assault, affray	<p>Intent to kill</p> <p>Strangled</p>	<p>SNPP 25 years Strangled 16y male - no motive - victim vulnerable with autism and intellectual disability, alone in apartment – offender impaired such that he did not know that act morally wrong - suffering from drug-induced psychosis result of self-induced acute intoxication - impairment caused solely by temporary effect of ingesting ice – experiencing command hallucinations, in form of voices directing or he would suffer certain consequences - smothering, manual strangulation with bare hands, and strangulation with cord. History of chronic mental illness, drug abuse and addiction (ice) – remorse – PTSD – special circumstances.</p>

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
53.	ERDOGAN (19 at offence; 23 at sentence) [2023] NSWSC 101 Ierace J	VG	35y NPP 24y		Larceny, common assault, driving, contravening ADVO. On bail.	Assault and stabbing Intent to kill	SNPP 25 years With 2 co-offenders - instigated murder of 17y male - assaulted over approximately two hours - motive for assaults, until time of intention to kill, was anger towards victim since earlier argument - tortured over extended period and repeatedly stabbed – hit to head with cricket bat or wrench and kicking or stomping - stabbed in neck area 22 times, snapping blade of knife – degree of premeditation. No remorse - guarded prospects rehabilitation - violence and fact and mode of killing of remain essentially unexplained behaviour – ADHD - long-standing mental health issues sufficiently serious to destabilise education and functioning in society.
54.	KOVALEFF (19) [2023] NSWSC 302 Rothman J	PG (15%) Murder Wound with intent cause GBH	34y NPP 24y 6y 9m NPP 4y 9m <u>Total:</u> 36y NPP 26y			Stabbed Intent to kill	SNPP 25y Stabbed 17y female and wounded 17y girlfriend – previously told girlfriend he wanted to kill her – attended hotel room with both victims intending to kill girlfriend – premeditated and planned two murders – wrapped girlfriend with her clothing and duct tape to keep her alive so as to have sex with her – rang and told father he had stabbed victims Motive elusive - feigned psychiatric illness for two years - impossible to find offender suffers personality disorder - no psychosis or sexual disorder – pathological interest in Ted Bundy, serial killer - borderline intellectual capacity
55.	KS (No.1) (16) [2023] NSWSC 696 Yehia J [2024] NSWCCA 147	PG (25%) Murder GBH with intent cause GBH	14y 3m 7y 6m <u>Aggregate</u> 16y NPP 11y	AD	Nil	Stabbing Intent cause GBH	Single stabbing of 16y male deceased – multiple stabbing of second 16y male victim - ongoing arguments – deceased and second victim approached offender’s home yelling abuse – offender took knife and met with victims outside where stabbings took place. Lack of planning and premeditation – intent to cause GBH. Mental health issues - prospects of rehabilitation very good - family support.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
56.	RUMSBY (No.6) (30 / 31 at offences – 56 at sentence) [2023] NSWSC 916 RA Hulme AJ	VG Murder Att choke with intent to sexually assault	27y NPP 19y 10y NPP 7y 6m Total: 32y NPP 24y		Breached recog – subsequent conviction for indecent assault offences	Asphyxiation Intent to kill	(1998/1999) Approached 18y female waiting outside house in early hours of morning – punched victim to face, forced her to ground, continued punching and attempted sexual assault – 12 mths later followed 17y female walking home along dark road in early hours of morning – sexually motivated attack – suffocated victim – spontaneous offences – elements of brutal violence Old sentencing patterns applied – facilitation of justice – difficult childhood – physical health issues
57.	BE (15) [2023] NSWSC 1007 RA Hulme AJ [2024] NSWCCA 100 Co-offender: BL [2024] AD [2024] SIONE [2024] DAWSON [2024]	PG (25%)	15y 6m NPP 10y	AD	Minor	Assault Intent GBH Accessory	One of group of people bashed 16y male victim over 33 minutes – victim suspected of stealing airpods so lured to home of owner – offender one of four who collected victim from station – victim assaulted by adult male in bedroom while offender and others looked on – when adult male left offender and others continued assault – sustained and extremely vicious involving kicking, punching and stomping – attack filmed – offender delivered at least 52 hits, 3 kicks and hair grab Difficult and disadvantaged childhood involving violence, neglect and exposure to alcohol and drug abuse – exposure to gang culture - uncontrollable behaviour, ADHD and Conduct Disorder – genuine remorse but continued violence in detention makes assessment of rehabilitation prospects difficult – some family support TB [2024] sentenced for manslaughter On appeal: no errors made and sentence not manifestly excessive
58.	AS (46) [2023] NSWSC 1575 Wilson J	VG	18y NPP 12y 6m		Nil	Shaking Reckless indifference	SNPP 25 years Shook son, 9m old baby, causing severe brain injury that was the direct cause of death one month later – victim at home with offender – wife returned home to find offender holding victim unresponsive - lost temper, briefly shaking victim - admissions to neighbours immediately after incident, but has since never acknowledged what he had done. No remorse - good character, strong work ethic - rehabilitation prospects reasonably positive. Afghanistan background – trauma - Post Traumatic Stress Disorder.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
59.	BL (15) [2024] NSWSC 51 RA Hulme AJ Co-Offender: BE [2023] AD [2024] SIONE [2024] DAWSON [2024]	PG (25%)	15y 6m NPP 10y		Of marginal significance	Assault Intent GBH Accessory	One of group of people bashed 16y male victim over 33 minutes – victim suspected of stealing airpods so lured to home of owner – offender phoned and texted victim and was one of four who collected victim from station – victim assaulted by adult male in bedroom while offender and others looked on – when adult male left offender and others continued assault – sustained and extremely vicious involving kicking, punching and stomping – attack filmed Traumatic and dysfunctional childhood including exposure to family violence – PTSD – some evidence of progress in custody – remorse – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – special circumstances permitting offender stay in juvenile custody until 21y TB [2024] sentenced for manslaughter
60.	AA (a pseudonym) (18) [2024] NSWSC 409 Huggett SCJ	PG (25%) Sched: Use offensive weapon with intent to intimidate	12y 3m NPP 8y		Assault, AOABH, receiving, driving unlicensed	Suffocate Intent to kill	SNPP 25y Female - young mother suffocated 11-month-old baby daughter - precise mechanism of suffocation not known - no other violence, neglect or abuse - volatile relationship with child's father - irrational motive that her conduct would lead to resumption of relationship with child's father – belief arose from post-traumatic stress disorder and personality disorder existing at time of offence - intent to kill but intention formed impulsively, without planning and fleeting - mental health impairments closely connected to offending that objective seriousness reduced. Traumatic background – remorse – positive rehabilitation prospects - special circumstances.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
61.	AD (13y 11m) [2024] NSWSC 444 RA Hulme AJ Co-Offender: BE [2023] BL [2024] SIONE [2024] DAWSON [2024]	PG (20%)	14y 4m NPP 9y 3m		nil	Assault Constructive murder Accessory	One of group of people bashed 16y male victim over 33 minutes – victim suspected of stealing airpods so lured to home of owner – victim assaulted by adult male in bedroom while offender and others looked on – when adult male left offender and others continued assault – offender punched, kicked, and stomped on victim – kicked victim to face with such force head hit wall - sustained and extremely vicious assault involving kicking, punching and stomping – attack filmed – liability of offender based on constructive murder resulting from foundational offence of specially aggravated detain for advantage – offender did not intend or contemplate GBH and played no role in luring victim to house Youth – remorse – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – difficult childhood including exposure to violence and substance abuse, gang membership and lack of parental guidance reducing moral culpability TB [2024] sentenced for manslaughter
62.	SIONE (32) DAWSON (19) [2024] NSWSC 846 RA Hulme AJ Co-offenders BE [2023] BL [2024] AD [2024]	VG VG	32y NPP 24y 20y NPP 13y		Significant violence – breached conditional liberty Record – breached conditional liberty	Assault Accessory liability	SNPP 25 years 16y male bashed by group over 33 minutes – victim accused by D of stealing airpods so lured to her home – assault in bedroom initiated by S and continued by other male juvenile offenders after S left – D encouraged assault by presence, words and filming – frenzied assault involving extreme violence on vulnerable and defenceless victim – S older and took lead in offence – greater liability than co-offenders – liability based on joint criminal enterprise to inflict GBH – liability of D based on extended joint criminal enterprise to detain and assault foreseeing possibility of intentional GBH S - Samoan / Tongan heritage – suggestion of difficult childhood but does not reduce moral culpability – mental health issues – onerous custodial conditions D – female - significant cognitive impairment reducing moral culpability – behavioural and mental health issues – difficult childhood– onerous custodial conditions – genuine remorse – special circumstances TB [2024] sentenced for manslaughter

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
63.	AYLWARD (18) [2024] NSWSC 923 Wilson J	PG (25%)	18y NPP 12y		nil	Stabbed Intent to kill	SNPP 25 years Offender entered home of 17y male acquaintance late at night and fatally stabbed victim asleep in bed – had been told by family member victim had physically hurt her on earlier occasion – 12 stab wounds to head and upper torso – savage attack - some element of planning Childhood marred by physical, sexual and drug abuse – youth, immaturity and PTSD – reduction in moral culpability under <i>Bugmy</i> – physical health conditions – remorse - out of character
64.	STEIN (32) [2024] NSWSC 1080 Wilson J	VG	Life		Dishonesty and drug offences – breached parole at time of offence	Shooting Intent to kill	SNPP 25 years Shot 9y daughter of fiancé while victim in offender's care in remote residence in Blue Mountains – shot victim in hip then at point blank range in face – victim vulnerable because of age, drowsiness due to drug and isolation – used stolen rifle – motive unknown – breach of trust – took elaborate steps in attempt to dispose of body over several days – placed body in barrel, filled with sand and rolled towards river – lied to fiancé suggesting victim first being cared for then kidnapped – offence at top of range No mitigation of moral culpability – no remorse – rejected claims of mental illness – bleak prospects of rehabilitation – danger to community Reasons for life sentence: vulnerability of victim and nature of killing and - moral culpability undiminished by any mitigating factors – strong community interest in heavy punishment and retribution being visited on the offender.- risk of future offending - specific and general deterrence

Last updated: Aug 2024

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.