## **Re-Determination of Life Sentence**

## **Multiple Murders**

Case	Age	Offence	Plea	Re-determination (earliest release date)	Appeal	Record	Facts
<b>Skinner</b> NSWSC 24.8.1990 (Wood J)	(49)	2 x Murder	VG	MT 31y 3m 24d AT 5y (1.9.1990) Effective MT: 17y 1m			<ul> <li>(1968) Four men armed with rifles made commando style raid on boatshed. Shot dead caretaker and police officer investigating robbery. Uppermost range of seriousness.</li> <li>Released to licence twice. Good prison record</li> </ul>
Sorenson NSWSC 6.9.1990 (Wood J)	25	4 x Murder		MT 21y 6m AT 7y (25.9.1990)		stealing	<ul> <li>(1968) Arson in flats killing four people. Set fire to newspapers and retired to bed. Lit three fires in previous three weeks. No motive.</li> <li>Psychiatric disorder. Scheduled to Morriset on several occasions. Released on licence for 14m - revoked for arson offence.</li> <li>Rehabilitation reasonable but continued instability.</li> <li>Much improvement in recent years.</li> </ul>
Markham NSWSC 2.10.1990 (Wood J)	37	2 x Murder	VG	MT 16y 4m AT 6y (8.12.1990) Effective MT: 12y 6m			(1974) Argument with V in hotel. Retrieved gun from home (testing it against lounge room wall) and returned to hotel. Argument continued and shot V and another man in laneway outside. Good behaviour in gaol until escape. Sentenced for further offences in Qld. Since extradition excellent rehabilitation.
<b>Coman</b> NSWSC 26.4.1991 (Studdert J)		2 x Murder	VG	MT 13y AT 4y (1.8.1991)			(1977) Killed wife and ex-lover after they rejected him and formed lesbian relationship. Unsatisfactory progress in gaol initially. Later good rehabilitation.
<b>Gregory</b> NSWSC 7.6.1991 (Finlay J)	16/17	2 x Murder	VG	MT 16y AT 9y (17.3.1993)		nil	<ul> <li>(1976) Murdered two 12y boys six months apart.</li> <li>Each lured to secluded park and sexually assaulted.</li> <li>One V hit on head with large stone, other stabbed.</li> <li>Sought to place blame for killing on another person.</li> <li>Good rehabilitation.</li> </ul>

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

Case	Age	Offence	Plea	Re-determination (earliest release date)	Appeal	Record	Facts
Dent NSWSC 26.7.1991 (McInerney J)	17	2 x Murder	VG (S Def rejected)	MT 14y 8m 9d AT 4y (1.7.1992)			(1977) Bashed two vagrants after altercation. Motive unclear. Substantially rehabilitated.
McCafferty NSWSC 15.10.1991 (Wood J)	25	3 x Murder	VG (insanity rejected)	MT 20y AT Life (30.8.1993)		poor	(1973) Acute breakdown when wife accidentally suffocated baby in bed and under delusion he must kill seven people. Killings extremely and mindlessly violent, in company of other young people. Stabbed or shot three strangers on different occasions. Suffering mental disorder but DR not available. Continued to be aggressive and psychotic in gaol - needed sedation. Convicted of manslaughter of prisoner while in gaol and sentenced to 14 years. Later settled down and received good reports. Mental condition improved.
<b>Perry</b> NSWSC 1.11.1991 (Studdert J)	29	3 x Murder Mal set fire to dwelling	VG	MT 14y 2m 9d AT 5y (11.12.1991)		nil relevant	<ul> <li>(1977) Set fire to staircase killing a father and two children after argument.</li> <li>Female - Psychiatric condition.</li> <li>Reasonable rehabilitation although cannabis problems.</li> </ul>
<i>Fairley</i> NSWSC 8.11.1991 (Newman J)		2 x Murder		MT 13y 6m AT 4y (24.5.1992)			(1978) Shot dead couple to prevent discovery of insurance fraud. Planned, cold blooded, calculated murder. Most serious. Extraordinary rehabilitation.
<b>Petroff</b> NSWSC 12.11.1991 (Hunt J)		3 x Murder	VG	MT 13y 3m AT 2y (19.12.1991)		nil	<ul><li>(1978) Shot man and two women after drug rip off.</li><li>No premeditation and under influence of drugs.</li><li>Model prisoner, unlikely to re-offend, done everything possible to prepare for release.</li></ul>
Salem NSWSC 20.11.1991 (Sully J)	38 (51)	2 x Murder	VG	MT 14y AT 6y (3.10.1992)		not significant	(1978) Shot two neighbours thirteen times after argument over land access. Obsequious prisoner with repressed aggression.
Hadina NSWSC 13.12.1991 (Wood J)		4 x Murder	VG	MT 14y 6m AT 4y (11.4.1992)		nil	(1977) Yugoslav stabbed estranged wife and three children. Jealousy and anger at wife. Model prisoner.

Case	Age	Offence	Plea	Re-determination (earliest release date)	Appeal	Record	Facts
<b>Smith</b> NSWSC 27.3.1992 (Newman J)		2 x Murder	VG	MT 13y 9m AT 4y (1.10.1992)			(1978) Killed two men in drunken brawl in restaurant. Good rehabilitation. Structured release date so 6m work release.
Carroll NSWSC 22.5.1992 (Finlay J)		2 x Murder 1 x Attempt murder	VG	MT 13y AT 5y (1.9.1992)		very bad - mostly dishonesty	(1979) Killed two people found in bed with ex-de facto. Attempted to shoot de facto but she escaped. Became informer in gaol.
Turner NSWSC 20.8.1992 (Wood J)	20 (64)	3 x murder		1948 FT to expire 21.8.1992 <u>1973</u> MT 20y AT Life (26.8.1993)			<ul> <li>(1948) Strangled 15y girlfriend and killed father with axe. Tried and convicted for girlfriend only. Death sentence commuted to life. Conceded killed father also. Released licence 1970.</li> <li>(1973) Stabbed mother-in-law and 11y grandson looking for estranged wife. Boy stabbed trying to protect grandmother.</li> <li>Patchy rehabilitation. Satisfactory since 1983. Needs to be prepared for release.</li> </ul>
Moore 4.9.1992 NSWSC (Loveday J)	17 – 18	3 x Murder 2 x Attempt murder		MT 13y 9m AT 11y 3m (31.12.1993)			(1980) Young female killed children she was baby- sitting. Severe mental problems. Good rehabilitation. Mental condition improved.
<i>MacPherson</i> NSWSC 16.10.1992 (Slattery AJ)	39 / 42 (56)	2 x Murder	VG	MT 15y AT 12y (13.5.1993)		poor record, on parole both occasions	<ul> <li>(1975) Shot and assaulted 77y male with hammer during robbery.</li> <li>(1978) Picked up 17y male runaway and shot him in head while sleeping. Concerned V had seen stolen guns.</li> <li>Transsexual who now regards himself as female.</li> <li>Good rehabilitation. Credit given for assisting authorities during industrial action.</li> </ul>
<i>McWaters</i> NSWSC 19.10.1992 (McInerney J)	(56)	2 x Murder Wound w/i to murder	VG	MT 13y AT Life (8.12.1993)		very minor	<ul> <li>(1980) History of animosity with neighbours. Shot both neighbours then shot at police officer who arrived on scene.</li> <li>On re-determination judge declined to find diminished responsibility but accepted some degree of mental disorder. Some rehabilitation although needs conditional release before parole granted. Concerns about mental state.</li> </ul>

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

Case	Age	Offence	Plea	Re-determination (earliest release date)	Appeal	Record	Facts
Crump NSWSC 10.12.1992 (Loveday J) NSW CCA 30.5.1994 NSWSC 24.4.1997 (McInerney J) [2016] NSWCCA 2 Co-accused: BAKER	24	Murder Conspiracy to murder 2 x Mal wound with intent to prevent apprehension	VG	First application refused Second application: MT 30y AT Life (13.11.2003)	AD Leave to appeal dismissed	mostly in gaol since 18	(1973) Shot stranger point blank range for robbery. Four days later broke into farm once male left. Kidnapped and raped female, taking her to Qld and shooting her there. Rape and murder committed in Qld. Stole car in NSW and shot at pursuing police car, wounding one officer in head. Received 15 years for other offences. Follower - led by Baker.
Baker           NSWSC           10.5.1993           (Sully J)           NSW CCA           23.5.1994           [2001] NSWSC 412           (G.James J)]           [2002] NSWCCA 184;           (2002) 130 A Crim R           417           (2004) 223 CLR 513           HCA           Co-accused: CRUMP	(45)	Murder Conspiracy to murder 2 x Mal wound with intent to prevent apprehension	VG	refused	AD AD		(1973) Shot stranger point blank range for robbery. Four days later broke into farm once male left. Kidnapped and raped female, taking her to Qld and shooting her there. Rape and murder committed in Qld. Stole car in NSW and shot at pursuing police car, wounding one officer in head. Received 15 years for additional offences.

Case	Age	Offence	Plea	Re-determination (earliest release date)	Appeal	Record	Facts
Hitchins NSWSC 3.6.1993 (Grove J) Co-offender ELLIOT	16	2 x Murder	VG	MT 24y AT Life (15.7.2005)		juvenile	(1981) Robbed and stabbed taxi driver with co- offenders. Robbed another taxi driver with different co-offender, placing V in boot and setting fire to taxi. Leader. Done little in gaol to improve self.
<b>Rees</b> NSWSC 12.8.1993 (Smart J)	28 (45)	3 x Murder Mal wound w/i to avoid apprehension	PG	MT 27y AT Life (24.11.2007)			<ul> <li>(1977) Shot two men in head during robbery of store when they failed to co-operate. Stole guns.</li> <li>(1980) Shot police officer making inquiries for fear that he would recognise gun. Shot another officer attempting to arrest him.</li> <li>Received 10 years for mal wound offence.</li> <li>Reasonable rehabilitation.</li> </ul>
<b>Cribb</b> NSWSC 12.11.1993 (Newman J) NSW CCA 4.11.1994		3 x Murder Rape	PG	Refused	AD	Included AR. On parole at time of offence. Escaped while on remand and committed kidnapping and rape.	Broke into house. Abducted mother and two children, sexually assaulted and stabbed all three over long period of time. Worst type of case. Received 12 years for rape.
Caldwell NSWSC 3.12.1993 (Finlay J)	19	2 x Murder 2 x AR with wounding	VG	MT 16y AT 9y (19.11.1997)		poor	(1981) 2 stabbing murders during separate robberies. Achieved as much rehabilitation in gaol as possible.
<b>Boyd</b> NSWSC 7.7.1994 (Carruthers J) (1995) 81 A Crim R 260 NSWCCA [2017] NSWSC 863	26-7 (34) (61)	4 x Murder 1 x Wound w/i murder	VG (autom rejected)	Refused	AD	property	<ul> <li>(1982) Sexually assaulted and slashed throat of female in her home.</li> <li>(1983) Fatal assault of male stranger met in hotel.</li> <li>Later that night sexually assaulted and stabbed three women, killing two.</li> <li>2017 application – worst case murder displaying sexual sadism no feature reducing moral culpability – even after 30 years continue to lack insight – little comfort from psychiatric reports</li> </ul>

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

Case	Age	Offence	Plea	Re-determination (earliest release date)	Appeal	Record	Facts
Main NSWSC 18.8.1995 (Allen J) [1999] NSWSC 1174 (Adams J) [2008] NSWSC 692 (Adams J) [2009] NSWCCA 14	28 [53]	2 x Murder Attempted AR	VG	Refused Refused <i>1st Murder:</i> 26y NPP 25y 5d (concurrent to sentence for AR) <i>Second Murder:</i> Life NPP 25y (partially concurrent - 27.5.2012)	Crown AD	on licence for AR	<ul> <li>(1983) Shot V during AR. While on remand killed another prisoner in contract killing. Felony murder. Injected heroin into V.</li> <li>SORC recommended no release at this time. Failed to overcome drug problem. Both applications refused on basis sentence at this time would be extremely long and some signs of rehabilitation.</li> <li>2008 application - new material demonstrated significant improvement in behaviour, attitude and prospects of rehabilitation. Lesser determinate sentences imposed for attempted AR and first murder offence. Doubts raised as to whether second murder was cold blooded contract killing.</li> </ul>
Hatziathanasiou NSWSC 25.10.1995 (James J) Co-accused: CONSTANTIOU	21 (33)	2 x Murder 11 x Robbery offences	VG PG	MT 20y AT 6y (6.1.2003)		minor, no gaol	<ul> <li>(1982) Series of robberies on older men. Three men died as result of muggings although H involved in two only.</li> <li>Received 10 years for robbery offences.</li> <li>Convictions for gaol violence. Eventual rehabilitation.</li> <li>Most of the sentence done on protection.</li> </ul>
<i>Lyttle</i> NSWSC 6.3.1996 (Newman J) NSW CCA 18.11.1996	(44)	4 x Murder Mal set fire to dwelling	VG	MT 28y AT Life (14.2.2004)	AD	priors for arson and dishonesty	<ul> <li>(1975) Started fire at Savoy Hotel. Angry at failing to find male companionship on street. 15 people died, 22 injured. Lit fires on four other occasions around same time.</li> <li>Received 14y for arson.</li> <li>Progress in gaol but continues to deny guilt.</li> </ul>
<i>Peisely</i> NSWSC 7.11.1997 (Newman J)		2 x Murder	VG	MT 14y AT 10y (5.12.2001)		firearm offences	(1987) Confronted both victim with rifle and killed them. Intoxicated. History of bad blood. Gave self up to police. Since attending Special Care Unit radical change in attitude; remorse.

Case	Age	Offence	Plea	Re-determination (earliest release date)	Appeal	Record	Facts
Robinson NSWSC 28.11.1997 (Abadee J)	(63)	2 x Murder	VG	MT 16y AT Life		nil serious	<ul> <li>(1980) Shot 74y woman and 53y son and blew up bodies in mine for financial gain.</li> <li>1990 sentenced for conspiracy to murder witness in murder trial (MT 6y AT 2y from 3.5.1991). Offence committed in gaol.</li> <li>Good rehabilitation although maintains innocence.</li> </ul>
Picknell NSWSC 10.11.1998 (Wood CJ at CL) Co-offender SKINNER	(55)	2 x Murder	VG	MT 34y AT Life (12.10.2002) Effective MT: 23y 1m 2d		LMV and BES Committed further serous offences while on licence	<ul> <li>(1968) Four men armed with rifles made commando style raid on boatshed. Shot dead caretaker and police officer investigating robbery. Uppermost range of seriousness.</li> <li>Released to licence twice.</li> <li>Good conduct in gaol since return to custody.</li> <li>Physical condition only fair. Anger and bitterness towards legal system hindering rehabilitation.</li> </ul>
Alexander [1999] NSWSC 413; (1999) 107 A Crim R <u>449</u> (Kirby J) [2000] NSWCCA 553	24 (37)	2 x Murder	VG	MT 21y AY 8y (19.8.2006)	AD	minor drugs and larceny	(1985) Strangled and stabbed 42y female flatmate after argument over rent. Stabbed and bashed V's 3y daughter with piece of wood. On protection. Escaped while in custody. Good rehabilitation but recent urine samples indicate drug use.
<u>Gidley</u> [1999] NSWSC 498 Bell J		2 x Murder 1 x Rob with striking 1 x AR	VG PG	MT 19y AT 11y (8.3.2001)		Escapee – lengthy record	<ul> <li>(1982) Struck elderly couple over head in their home.</li> <li>Breached parole – robbed Real Estate agent with sawn off shotgun – Struck customer</li> <li>Received 10 years for additional offences.</li> <li>Additional escape offence committed – psychiatric condition</li> </ul>
<u>Sergi</u> [1999] NSWSC 728 Bell	21 (53)	2 x Murder	VG	MT 11y AT to expire 19.7.1999		nil	(1967) Shot brother and sister-in-law after accusation made about morality of sister. Calabrian background and felt he had to protect family honour. Released on licence 1978. Married and conducted successful business until sentenced to 6y in 1993 for manufacture cannabis. Good rehabilitation.

Case	Age	Offence	Plea	Re-determination (earliest release date)	Appeal	Record	Facts
Constantinou           [1999] NSWSC 520;           (1999) 108 A Crim R           73           (James J)           [2000] NSWCCA 42           Co-accused:           HATZIATHANASIOU		3 x Murder 5 x Rob w/ striking and wounding	VG	MT 30y AT Life (8.1.2013)	AA MT 25y AT 10y (9.1.2008)		(1982) Series of robberies on older men. Three men died as result of muggings. One offence committed by C alone. Some rehabilitation later in sentence.
Websdale [2000] NSWSC 636 (Suddert J)	20 (30)	2 x Murder Wound with intent to murder Mal wounding	VG	25y NPP 18y 9m (7.8.2008)		nil	(1989) Shearer working on station entered room and fired at four occupants with M1 30 calibre semi- automatic rifle. Killed two victims, rendered one victim a quadriplegic and injured fourth victim. Savage and senseless outburst of violence. Response to sexual taunting. Motive for offence unclear. Sentenced to 10y for other offences.
<u>Staples</u> [2001] NSWSC 990 (Dowd J)	33 (47)	Murder Manslaughter	PG	28y NPP 20y (18.2.2007)			<ul> <li>(1987) Stabbed wife 39 times when discovered he was not biological father of son - despite knowing wife alive cut telephone wires and left house - enticed 2y son playing in backyard over - stabbed him in chest twice - premeditated and brutal murder - 8m foetus also killed.</li> <li>Sentenced to 15 years for manslaughter of wife.</li> <li>Appalling background - some attempt made at rehabilitation - unusual, narcissistic and eccentric man, limited insight, limited intelligence and personality disorder</li> </ul>