## Maintain Unlawful Sexual Relationship Current Offence – Max Penalty - Life s.66EA (NSW) <u>Crimes Act</u>

s 66EA(1) Adult engages in 2 or more sexual acts with or towards a child over any period

Maximum Penalty: life

<u>Commenced</u>: 1.12.2018

s.66EA(7) This section extends to a relationship that existed wholly or partly before the commencement of the relevant amendments, or the predecessor offence, if the acts engaged in by the accused were unlawful sexual acts during the period in which the relationship existed.

## Note: the effect of recent statutory provisions relating to the application of sentencing patterns and practices:

s.25AA(1) (NSW) Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act applied to sentences imposed on or after 31.8.2018. It required a court to sentence an offender for a child sexual offence in

accordance with the sentencing patterns and practices at the time of sentencing, not at the time of the offence.

This provision was replaced by s.21B(1) (NSW) <u>Crimes (Sentencing Procedure) Act</u> on 18.10.2022 which extends the requirement to all offences.

|    | NAME<br>(age if known)                   | OFFENCE  | PLEA        | TOTAL<br>SENTENCE                                     | APPEAL  | RECORD | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY  |
|----|--|----------|-------------|---|---|--------|--|
|    | GP (a pseudonym)<br>[2021] NSWCCA<br>180 | s.66EA   | PG<br>(20%) | 13y 6m<br>NPP 9y 9m                                   | AA<br>12y<br>NPP 8y 7m                                  |        | Sexually abused step daughter aged 12-13y over 7 months<br>– rubbed breasts and stomach and forced penile/vaginal<br>intercourse day before marrying complainant's mother –<br>forced fellatio in shed and multiple counts of penile/vaginal   |
| 1. |  | s.61M(2) |             | 19m<br>NPP 14m<br><u>Total</u> :<br>14y<br>NPP 10y 3m | 19m<br>NPP 14m<br><u>Total</u> :<br>12y 6m<br>NPP 9y 1m |        | intercourse in complainant's bedroom – further acts of<br>penile/vaginal intercourse while staying overnight with<br>complainant away from home – told complainant to stay<br>silent or offences would ruin mother's life – also threatened<br>suicide – indecently assaulted second complainant on car<br>trip to Sydney<br><u>Bugmy</u> factors – profound childhood deprivation – heroin<br>baby – incarcerated parents – foster child – childhood<br>sexual abuse – remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation |
|    |  |          |             |   |   |        | On appeal: sentence erroneously based on offender<br>ejaculating on more than one occasion<br>At [63]-[64] – observations in <u>Burr</u> [2020] NSWCCA 282 at<br>[160] as to factors bearing on seriousness of old offence<br>apply to new offence.  |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|    | NAME<br>(age if known)                               | OFFENCE                  | PLEA                    | TOTAL<br>SENTENCE   | APPEAL                   | RECORD                                  | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|----|--|--------------------------|-------------------------|---|--------------------------|---|---|
| 2. | Xerri<br>(48 -50 at offence)<br>[2021] NSWCCA<br>268 | s.66EA<br>Contravene AVO | PG<br>(20%)             | 8y<br>NPP 4y 9m<br>FT 4m<br><u>Total</u><br>8y 2m<br>NPP 4y 11m | AD                       | Nil relevant.<br>Old assault<br>matter. | <ul> <li>(2016-2018) Female complainant aged 14 - 16 – vaginal-<br/>penile intercourse on number of occasions over 18 month<br/>period – grooming of complainant over prior two year<br/>period.</li> <li>Low intellectual functioning - disregard of AVO which had<br/>been put in place to protect complainant- lack of insight into<br/>offending.</li> </ul>  |
| 3. | Towse<br>(40)<br>[2022] NSWCCA<br>252                | s.66EA                   | PG<br>(35%<br>combined) | 8y<br>NPP 5y  | AA<br>5y 3m<br>NPP 3y 3m | Nil                                     | 9y old stepdaughter – five ingredient offences occurred<br>over a week – touched vagina, vaginal-digital penetration –<br>included Queensland offences of indecent treatment of a<br>child; placed complainant's hand on penis - serious breach<br>of trust.<br>Difficult upbringing - prospects for rehabilitation reasonable.<br>CCA: Sentence manifestly excessive - actual conduct<br>occurred within brief period - does not bear comparison with<br>extended period of offending / more serious offending in<br>comparative cases - "unsophisticated person intellectually"<br>who suffers from social anxiety, lack of insight; element of<br>general deterrence is reduced. |

|    | NAME<br>(age if known)  | OFFENCE              | PLEA              | TOTAL<br>SENTENCE                    | APPEAL                              | RECORD   | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY  |
|----|---|----------------------|-------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--|--|
|    | JG<br>[2023] NSWCCA<br>33   | s.66EA               | PG<br>(25%)       | Indicative:<br>11y                   | AA<br><u>Indicative:</u><br>9y      |  | Sexual offending against four children - each victim a<br>member of offender's extended family - persistent sexual<br>abuse of two children, AB and PC – AB (aged 13-15y): 10-<br>15 acts of sexual touching of AB over 15-month period; |
|    | s.66EA<br>s.66DB(a)<br>s.66DB(a)<br>s.61M(2)  | s.66EA               |                   | 8y                                   | 4y 6m                               |  | applicant touching AB's penis or putting his hands on AB's penis - PC (aged 12-14y): 10 incidents in NSW and ACT   |
|    |   | s.66DB(a)            |                   | 9m                                   | Remaining indicative                |  | over 39-month period; ever-increasing sexual assaults;<br>touching complainant's penis, masturbating complainant   |
|    |   | s.66DB(a)            |                   | 12m                                  | sentences not<br>varied.            |  | until ejaculation, stimulating accidental urination; grooming, plying PC with alcohol; implied threat by way of casting guilt  |
| 4. |   | s.61M(2)             |                   | 2y 8m<br>NPP 2y                      |                                     |  | onto PC not to tell anyone.<br>Does not accept diagnosis of paedophilic disorder - high<br>risk of reoffending – remorse.  |
|    |   | 2 x s.61M(2)         |                   | 3y<br>NPP 2y 3m                      |                                     |  | CCA: Not open to sentencing judge to find s.66EA offending within mid-range – comparative cases discussed.   |
|    |   | s.91H(2)             |                   | 18m                                  |                                     |  |  |
|    |   |                      |                   | <u>Aggregate</u> :<br>17y<br>NPP 12y | <u>Aggregate</u> :<br>13y<br>NPP 9y |  |  |
|    | DB         s.66EA [25y]           (60 at sentence)         [2024] NSWCCA           18         s.66EA [life] | PG<br>(25%)          | 19y<br>NPP 14y 6m | AA<br>19y                            | Minor                               | (1999-2010) Sexually abused 5-16y daughter – indecent touching, digital penetration, cunnilingus and attempted |  |
|    |   | s.66EA [life]        | (25%)             | NFF 149 011                          | NPP14y 3m                           |  | penile penetration – forced complainant to undress for<br>recording - used threats and bribery – toward high end of  |
|    | 10  | s.91G(1)(a)          |                   |                                      |                                     |  | range<br>(2018-2021) repeated indecent touching of 7-9y child in   |
| 5. |   | s.66DC(a)            |                   |                                      |                                     |  | care – complainant had mild autism and severe anxiety –<br>took photos of genitalia – exposed penis to second child in   |
|    |   | s.91G(1)(a)          |                   |                                      |                                     |  | care and took photos of genitalia – exposed penis to second child in<br>with moderate to severe autism and non-verbal – photos   |
|    |   | s.91H(2)             |                   |                                      |                                     |  | and videos of child pornography found on computer –<br>offences low to mid-range   |
|    |   | Sched:<br>3 offences |                   |                                      |                                     |  | Dysfunctional and disruptive childhood – mental health<br>issues – remorse<br>On appeal: error in application of statutory ratio   |

|    | NAME<br>(age if known)                                | OFFENCE  | PLEA        | TOTAL<br>SENTENCE                         | APPEAL                           | RECORD  | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|----|---|--|-------------|---|----------------------------------|---|---|
| 6. | WP<br>(48)<br>[2024] NSWCCA<br>77                     | s.66EA [life]<br>6 x s.59(1)<br>7 x s.61<br>s.66A<br>2 x s.61M(1)<br>9 x s.61O(1)<br>4 x s.66C(2)<br>2 x s.66D<br>s.91H(2) | PG          | 18y<br><u>Aggregate</u><br>28y<br>NPP 20y | AD                               | Larceny,<br>assault,<br>contravene<br>ADVO,<br>destruction<br>property, | <ul> <li>(1995-2019) Offences committed over 18 year period on 3 own children and 3 stepchildren (boys and girl) - s.66EA offence (1995 to 2005) started on stepson KG when aged 6y; fellatio and then anal intercourse when KG aged 12y – other offences committed on KG and other children - children regularly beaten, isolated and not permitted to leave their rooms for long periods of time, went without food.</li> <li>Dysfunctional upbringing - Indigenous - witnessed drug abuse and domestic violence - Poor understanding of sexual abuse and of own abusive behaviour and sexual interest in children - some risk of reoffending - prospects of rehabilitation guarded.</li> <li>CCA: SJ fail to award 5% discount for late pleas of guilty due to error by parties as to penalty for offences – however, no lesser sentence warranted.</li> </ul> |
| 7. | Massaquoi<br>(34 at offences)<br>[2024] NSWCCA<br>125 | s.66EA [life]  | VG          | 16y<br>NPP 10y                            | AD                               |   | (2013-2016) Female complainant aged 12-14y – offender in relationship with complainant's mother - penile-vaginal intercourse, fellatio, masturbation - level of exploitation, emotional threats.<br>War-torn background – PTSD - anxiety and depression.<br>CCA: No error as to findings of fact.   |
| 8. | MK<br>(29 at offences)<br>[2024] NSWCCA<br>127        | 3 x s.66EA [life]  | VG          | Aggregate<br>28y<br>NPP 21y               | AD                               | Nil   | (2017-2018) Male complainants were three brothers whose<br>mother in relationship with applicant – two complainants<br>aged 11 – inserted complainant's penis into applicant's<br>anus, digital-anal, penile-anal intercourse, fellatio,<br>masturbation – use of force, emotional blackmail, caused<br>pain – deliberate, manipulative, predatory nature of<br>offending - above mid-range seriousness.<br>Significant risk reoffending – mental health.<br>CCA: No error in factual findings.   |
| 9. | JA<br>(40)<br>[2024] NSWCCA<br>130                    | s.66EA <i>[life]</i><br>Common assault   | Not stated. | 14y 6m<br>NPP 11y<br>3m                   | AA<br>14y 6m<br>NPP 10y 4m<br>3m |   | Offences committed on step-daughter, aged 8-15y.<br>Special circumstances – PTSD.<br>CCA: Minor adjustment of NPP to give effect to special<br>circumstances.   |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)   | OFFENCE                           | PLEA | TOTAL<br>SENTENCE  | APPEAL   | RECORD                          | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|--|-----------------------------------|------|--|--|---------------------------------|---|
| 10. | Nolan<br>(41-45 at offences<br>– 65 at sentence)<br>[2024] NSWCCA<br>140 | s.66EA <i>[life]</i>              | VG   | 18y<br>NPP 13y   | AA<br>16y<br>NPP 11y 8m  | Nil relevant                    | (Feb 1999 – Feb 2002) Father sexually assaulted 5-8y<br>daughter – included sexual intercourse and indecent<br>touching – intentionally developed relationship – high<br>degree of emotional manipulation – offences committed in<br>victim's home – element of planning – not isolated acts –<br>high degree of seriousness<br>No insight or remorse<br>On appeal: SJ erroneously treated act of rubbing vagina as<br>digital penetration  |
| 11. | Fisher<br>(54 at sentence)<br>[2024] NSWCCA<br>191                       | 2 x s.66EA [life]<br>1 x s.91H(2) | VG   | Indicative<br>6y<br>7y<br>1y<br><u>Aggregate</u><br>10y<br>NPP 7y 6m | Crown AA<br>Indicative<br>11y<br>10y<br>1y<br>Aggregate<br>15y<br>NPP 11y 3m | Possess<br>child<br>pornography | <ul> <li>(2015 – 2018) Uncle to two female complainants – CH aged 8-12y, vulnerable, autism spectrum disorder, touched breasts, genitals, digital penetration, unlawful sexual acts occurred routinely up to around once per week or fortnight, then once per month – MH aged 7-11y; touched breasts, genitals, genitals with his penis, cunnilingus, estimated 120-140 unlawful sexual acts.</li> <li>Repeated persistent offending – no remorse - lack of insight - medium risk reoffending.</li> <li>CCA: Error in assessment of objective seriousness by acting upon wrong principle with respect to unlawful sexual acts that did not form alternative counts on indictment - sentence manifestly inadequate.</li> </ul> |

Last updated: October 2024

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.