

## Murder: 2023

**Maximum Penalty: Life (s.19A (NSW) Crimes Act)**

**Standard non-parole period (offences committed on or after 1.2.2003)**

20 years

25 years - Where the victim was a police officer, emergency services worker, correctional officer, judicial officer, health worker, teacher, community worker, or other public official, exercising public or community functions and the offence arose because of the victim's occupation or voluntary work

**Standard non-parole period (where conviction entered or plea of guilty made on or after 1.1.2008)**

25 years - Where the victim a child under 18 years of age

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
1.	CONWAY (45) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 55</a> Wilson J  <a href="#">[2023] NSWCCA 265</a>	VG	16y NPP 12y	Conviction AD	Long – mostly dishonesty	Stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed friend once to abdomen after minor argument over victim's refusal to play fight with knives – both under influence of ice – fled house Difficult personal life – sexual abuse, homelessness and early drug abuse – remorse – guarded prospects of rehabilitation
2.	STEFANATO (75) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 73</a> RA Hulme AJ	PG (25%) Murder  Possess rifle without permit	18y 2m NPP 13y 7m  Conviction without penalty		Nil significant	Shot  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Shot female victim to head when she came to ask offender for money – people in the area, including intravenous drug users, harassed offender for money before and after murder – offender would pay people money – offender said that victim “didn't deserve to be killed, she was the victim of me killing her because of all the other people” – angry and stressed by constant demands of people for money - threatened victim that he would shoot - hid body. Good character – genuinely remorseful – success with business.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
3.	<b>AHMED (No 2)</b> <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 105</a> N Adams J	VG	24y NPP 18y		Nil	Stabbed  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed wife with knife in home – multiple stab wounds to chest and abdomen - jealous, enraged that victim wanted to leave marriage for another man – victim feared for her life as to what offender would do to her if she left him - holding knife, demanded to see deceased's phone - jealous rage when saw text messages between deceased and man - already enraged before saw text messages and already had a knife with him - not premeditated – sat while deceased lay dying – by time telephoned police, deceased had died. Adjustment disorder – remorse
4.	<b>ERDOGAN</b> (19 at offence; 23 at sentence) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 101</a> Ierace J	VG	35y NPP 24y		Larceny, common assault, driving, contravening ADVO. On bail.	Assault and stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 25 years</b> With 2 co-offenders - instigated murder of 17y male - assaulted over approximately two hours - motive for assaults, until time of intention to kill, was anger towards victim since earlier argument - tortured over extended period and repeatedly stabbed – hit to head with cricket bat or wrench and kicking or stomping - stabbed in neck area 22 times, snapping blade of knife – degree of premeditation. No remorse - guarded prospects rehabilitation - violence and fact and mode of killing of remain essentially unexplained behaviour – ADHD - long-standing mental health issues sufficiently serious to destabilise education and functioning in society.
5.	<b>MUSA</b> (44) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 198</a> Button J	VG	20y NPP 14y		Nil	Motor vehicle  Intent to inflict serious physical injury	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Female – drove into former male partner crushing with car - discovery of former partner with another woman – spontaneous formation of intent to inflict really serious physical injury - intention lasted a few seconds - did not render assistance to victim – called emergency services after short time. Traumatic upbringing in war torn country – PTSD caused by experiences in war – no remorse or acceptance of responsibility.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
6.	WHITE (40) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 193</a> Ierace J	VG Murder  2 x Discharge firearm w/intent GBH  4 x Fire firearm into dwelling house, reckless  s.166 Certificate: 6 offences	<u>Indicative</u> 34y NPP 24y  14y NPP 10y  9y NPP 6y 6m  <u>Aggregate</u> 42y NPP 30y		Assault, behaving offensive manner, stalking / intimidation	Shot  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Shooting in suburban neighbourhood – offender’s relationship with neighbours deteriorated - 226 bullets fired from two rifles over approximately one hour – one victim killed and multiple injured - offender could not have seen victim inside residence and did not specifically target victim - intended to kill another person (S) by firing repeatedly into house Cognitive impairment consequent to brain injury - relevant to assessment of moral culpability – <i>Bugmy</i> ; disturbed childhood involving violence, sexual abuse and neglect - little insight into offences - qualified remorse – uncertain prospects of rehabilitation - special circumstances based on cognitive impairment.
7.	DEMPSEY (42 at offence - 53 at sentence) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 205</a> Hamill J	PG (10%)	19y 9m NPP 14y 6m		Possess drugs, produce etc child abuse material.	Drowning or bashed with weapon  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> (2012) Brutal sustained attack on former partner – hard blow with hammer or similar weapon to back of head – victim left naked in bathtub, extensive injuries - precise cause of death not determined: either drowning or direct result of severe head injury - not planned or pre-meditated. Dysfunctional childhood – special circumstances - reasonable prospects of rehabilitation - unlikely to reoffend.
8.	BOWIE (72) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 207</a> Yehia J	VG	24y NPP 18y		Shoot at with intent to murder, sexual offences, forgery, property destruction.	Unknown  Intent to kill	(1982) Killed wife - delay of 40 years between offence and sentence - motive to have relationship with another woman – offender “coerced” victim to write letters to create impression victim had left home voluntarily - disposal of body to elude detection – body never found – no valid conclusions can be reached about nature of act that caused death - degree of planning and premeditation, although not extensive or sophisticated Guarded prospects rehabilitation – no remorse - medical conditions that can be treated in custody

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
9.	<b>KOVALEFF</b> (19) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 302</a> Rothman J	PG (15%)  Murder  Wound with intent cause GBH	34y NPP 24y  6y 9m NPP 4y 9m  <u>Total:</u> 36y NPP 26y			Stabbed  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 25 years</b> Stabbed 17y female and wounded 17y girlfriend – previously told girlfriend he wanted to kill her – attended hotel room with both victims intending to kill girlfriend – premeditated and planned two murders – wrapped girlfriend with her clothing and duct tape to keep her alive so as to have sex with her – rang and told father he had stabbed victims Motive elusive - feigned psychiatric illness for two years - impossible to find offender suffers personality disorder - no psychosis or sexual disorder – pathological interest in Ted Bundy, serial killer - borderline intellectual capacity
10.	<b>HAMDACH</b> (31) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 298</a> Campbell J  Co-offender: KARAALI	PG (10%)	16y 2m NPP 12y		Nil relevant	Bashed / assault  Constructive  Accessory liability	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Victim defrauded offender through sale of fake airpods – offender recruited co-offender to use violence upon victim in order to obtain refund – with co-offender met victim at shopping centre carpark where co-offender assaulted victim - walked victim to another location – co-offender continued assault: bashed and kicked victim to head - victim suffered catastrophic brain injury - offence planned 24 hours prior – premeditated - constructive murder – not part of agreement that GBH would be intentionally inflicted - foundational offence was conceived and committed in retaliation for fake sale - joint criminal enterprise - specially aggravated kidnapping – offender instigator of foundational offence. Domestic violence in childhood - schizoaffective disorder with symptoms of mania involving over-confidence and assertiveness at time of offending - prior good character - pro-social life - unlikely re-offend – remorse.
11.	<b>KNIGHT</b> (52) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 321</a> Yehia J	PG (25%)  Schedule: Contravene ADVO	17y 6m NPP 12y 6m		AOABH	Single stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed female partner from whom separated following argument - single stab wound to victim's back - committed in presence of one of their children at victim's home – other children asleep in bedroom - heavily intoxicated – domestic violence. Aboriginal male - considerable remorse – <i>Bugmy</i> , dysfunctional childhood – special circumstances.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
12.	NH (57) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 428</a> Yehia J  Co-offenders: (2024) WOODS HAYES McLACHLAN HARDING FARNSWORTH	PG (50% combined)	13y NPP 8y 6m		Nil relevant	Shooting  Intent to kill  Acc liability	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Part of joint criminal enterprise to shoot dead president of rival bikie gang in country – drove four co-offenders to rural home of victim at night – entered house and bedroom of victim with three offenders, all armed and disguised – victim shot dead by co-offender – drove co-offenders from property, burned car and provided false alibi – joined enterprise two days prior to killing – lesser role than others - not principal and not involved in decision making – ‘minion’ – offence committed in home of victim, in company and involved planning – above mid-range Strong subjective case – sexually abused as a teenager for two years by employer – ongoing mental health issues – prior good character – remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation and unlikely to re-offend – two-year life expectancy due to cancer – onerous custodial conditions – special circumstances
13.	SMITH (No 2) (46) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 435</a> Ierace J	VG	24y NPP 15y		Assault, use weapon with intent to assault, reckless wounding, violence. On conditional liberty.	Bashed  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Female - struck elderly 77y male friend repeatedly with frying pan whilst heavily intoxicated – explosive and sustained fit of anger - victim may have triggered memory of offenders' past abusers - nexus between psychological disorders and commission of offence <i>Bugmy</i> principles applied – disadvantaged upbringing - PTSD and Borderline Personality Disorder- requires intensive psychiatric and drug and alcohol abuse therapy – no acceptance of responsibility

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
14.	SHILLINGSWORTH (21) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 453</a> Wright J  Co-offenders: DPD EE DJD: s.111(2) MURDOCH: s.111(2)	PG (25%)	13y 6m NPP 9y 6m		Not stated. On conditional liberty.	Stabbed  Constructive murder  Accessorial liability	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Male victim known to offenders – joint criminal enterprise to commit assault with intent to rob in company while armed with dangerous weapon – with four co-offenders forced themselves into victim’s home, one co-offender armed with shortened rifle – victim assaulted and stabbed multiple times – unable to establish identity of killer – offender had substantial role - provided vehicle in which offenders travelled to victim’s residence, pushed victim and present during assault and stabbing – some degree of planning and organisation – co-offender took money from victim’s flatmate part of motivation was to obtain money - lower part of mid-range of objective seriousness Aboriginal male – <i>Bugmy</i> principles applied, traumatic upbringing – mental health conditions - substance abuse – anxiety disorder – genuine remorse – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – youth - special circumstances - need for significant mental health and drug/alcohol treatment
15.	DPD (17y 6m) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 477</a> Wright J  Co-offender: SHILLINGSWORTH EE DJD: s.111(2) MURDOCH: s.111(2)	PG (17.5%) Murder  Sched: Possess shortened firearm Assault	15y 3m NPP 10y 3m			Stabbed  Constructive murder  Accessorial liability	Male victim known to offenders – joint criminal enterprise to commit assault with intent to rob in company while armed with dangerous weapon – with four co-offenders forced themselves into victim’s home - offender armed with shortened rifle – victim assaulted and stabbed multiple times – unable to establish identity of killer – offender had significant role – knew victim – carried firearm – first to reach front door - provided vehicle in which offenders travelled to victim’s residence, pushed victim and present during assault and stabbing – some degree of planning and organisation – stayed behind and attempted to obtain keys to quad bike from victim whilst still alive having been stabbed and assaulted flatmate – mid-range <i>Bugmy</i> applied, dysfunctional upbringing – significant mental health conditions causally related to offending – drug abuse - remorse – youth – some significant prospects of rehabilitation – special circumstances

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
16.	<b>DOUGLASS (No.2)</b> (26 at offences – 32 at sentence) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 465</a> Ierace J	VG	26y NPP 19y 6m		Driving and firearms offences	Stabbed  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> With male partner broke into home of 69y victim to steal cash – stabbed victim twice during struggle – took cash and left victim to die – returned at least once in month before victim found to steal further cash – callous indifference to victim – aggravating factors included in company, vulnerable victim and in home of victim – not originator – mid-range Female – difficult childhood – <i>Bugmy</i> applied – PTSD – subsequent abusive relationships – moral culpability somewhat reduced – good prospects of rehabilitation – third trial
17.	<b>HACHEM</b> (32) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 535</a> Wright J	VG Murder  Sched: 2 x Obt financial adv by deception	24y NPP 18y		nil	Unknown  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Met up with girlfriend in early hours of morning – angry at seeing victim kissing another man and lying to offender – victim killed in unknown manner – killing not planned – relationship difficult involving degree of violence, separations and reconciliation – attempted to conceal offence including disposal of body never found – fraud offences involved use of stolen credit cards – below mid-point in mid-range – domestic violence offence Unlikely to re-offend – good prospects of rehabilitation – facilitation of administration of justice
18.	<b>SULTANI</b> (24 at offence) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 645</a> Hamill J	PG (10%)	20y NPP 15y		Rob in company and agg break and enter prior to offence – life sentences imposed for murders committed subsequently	Assault  Extended joint criminal enterprise	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> (2013) At time of offence member or nominee of Motorcycle club and dealing in drugs – Victim one of three men who threatened associate of offender over drug debt – offender took group of eight men armed with mallet and baseball bat to intervene on associate's behalf – victim assaulted by group being hit to head and body over two minutes – offender did not physically assault victim – no intent to murder or even inflict GBH – victim died from head injuries several weeks later - planned, organised and savage criminal attack – lower end of mid-range Difficult childhood as son of refugees from Afghanistan – exposed to violence outside home – genuine remorse – subjected to serious violence in custody

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
19.	EE (17) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 104</a> Wright J  Co-offenders: DPD SHILLINGSWORTH DJD: s.111(2) MURDOCH: s.111(2)	PG Murder (50% combined)  Sched: Robbery	6y 3m NPP 4y 2m		Violence – agg break and enter – breached conditional liberty	Stabbing  Constructive murder  Accessorial liability	Went to home of victim with four accomplices for robbery – two accomplices armed with rifle and knife – not present in room when victim stabbed – did not intend or foresee co-offender acting with intent to kill or GBH – significantly less participation than co-offenders – robbed female resident of money - below mid-range Remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation – born in Liberia – violent father – other <i>Bugmy</i> considerations – gang involvement – drug abuse – assistance
20.	KS (No.1) (16) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 696</a> Yehia J  <a href="#">[2024] NSWCCA 147</a>	PG (25%) Murder  GBH with intent cause GBH	14y 3m  7y 6m  <u>Aggregate</u> 16y NPP 11y	AD	Nil	Stabbing  Intent GBH	Single stabbing of 16y male victim – multiple stabbing of second 16y male victim - ongoing arguments – deceased and second victim approached offender's home yelling abuse – offender took knife and met with victims outside where stabbings took place. Lack of planning and premeditation – intent to cause GBH. Mental health issues - prospects of rehabilitation very good - family support.
21.	VELLA (54) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 831</a> Wilson J	VG	24y NPP 18y		Nil	Shot	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Female – shot husband whilst asleep in eye / face - claimed amnesia of shooting - motivation will never be known - claims that victim was violent and controlling not established - formed plan to use gun kept in family home - took gun and four cartridges to bedroom prior to shooting - made internet searches concerning suicide, probably planned to kill herself - whether intended to also kill deceased is not known beyond reasonable doubt. Adjustment disorder and depression - remorse – good character - prospects of rehabilitation positive.

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
22.	<b>DOOLAN</b> (30) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 821</a> Lonergan J	VG	18y NPP 12y		Violence offence 10 years prior. First time in custody.	Assault  Intent to cause GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Male victim living at offender's mother's home - offender not happy about victim living there and wanted him to leave – attended mother's house with a friend after drinking – offender "lured" deceased outside – offender committed prolonged and violent attack – multiple, forceful blows, kicks and stomps to head - no evidence of planning - spontaneous offending - lower end mid-range. Very unlikely to reoffend – excellent prospects of rehabilitation – father – depression, alcohol and drug abuse - strong work ethic, good work history, family support.
23.	<b>CAMPBELL</b> (21) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 841</a> Garling J	PG (10%) Murder  s.33(1) Wound with intent to cause GBH	24y NPP 18y  7y 2m NPP 5y 4m  <u>Total:</u> 26y 6m NPP 20y 6m		Offences of violence – breached conditional liberty	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Offender travelling as passenger in car with two friends driving at night in country area – under influence of methylamphetamine offender stabbed driver from behind in arm – below mid-range - fatally stabbed male passenger – pursed second victim who left car and continued stabbing – unprovoked attack without warning – vicious, prolonged and violent – midrange No mitigation for drug use - aware drug use provoked acts of violence – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – onerous custodial conditions under Covid
24.	<b>McHENRY</b> (35) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 856</a> Wright J	VG Murder  s.166 Certificate: s.192E(1)(b)	<u>Indicative:</u> 22y NPP 15y 3m  12m  <u>Aggregate:</u> 22y 6m NPP 15y 6m		Nil significant	Assault / stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Female killed at home of offender – several severe blows to head with blunt weapon and multiple stab wounds to head, back and arm – next day body wrapped up and placed in kitchen cupboard by offender's ex-partner – body then moved to ex-partner's van and left there for 7 days before disposing of body in creek – offender obtained \$50 from victim's mother pretending to be victim – sought to convince 17y friend to burn down offender's house – circumstances of killing unclear - unable to decide role of offender in killing but at least had prior awareness – below mid-range Female – drug user – mental health issues including PTSD – good prospects of rehabilitation and unlikely to re-offend – special circumstances

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
25.	<b>KARAALI (No 10)</b> (26) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 866</a> Campbell J  <a href="#">[2024] NSWCCA 162</a>  Co-offender: HAMDACH	VG	28y NPP 21y	AD	Common assault, agg BE, resist police, supply drugs, firearms, driving offences. On parole.	Assault  Intent to kill  Accessorial liability	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Acted as “muscle” on behalf of co-offender – co-offender recruited offender to exact retribution on male victim for selling fake earbuds / airpods - serious physical assault including punches, kicks, athletic high-kick to the head and stomping to head - victim suffered extensive catastrophic brain injury - offender denied assistance from passers-by and told lies explaining victim’s state of being unconscious. Drug use - substance abuse disorder - never given account of his part in offending – unsettled upbringing - absence of remorse - prospects of rehabilitation guarded. On appeal: no error in finding as to intent or parity and not manifestly excessive
26.	<b>BIDNER</b> (30) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 880</a> Wilson J  <a href="#">[2024] NSWCCA 204</a>	PG (5%)	24y 8m NPP 18y	AD	AOABH, resist police, assault, obtain adv by deception, destroy property, police pursuit, fail to appear, goods in custody, receiving, take and drive conveyance, possess and unsafe keeping of shortened firearm without license.	Motor vehicle  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Motor vehicle used as weapon – hostility between offender and male victim - offender reversed his vehicle into victim while victim was standing with back to vehicle – drove across victim’s back, neck, and lower skull, with weight of car crushing him - significant injuries, died at scene – offender left scene, concealed and cleaned vehicle, removed and disposed its tyres - spontaneous and opportunistic – absence of provocation – attempts to conceal evidence – high moral culpability. Lack of evidence of remorse – drug use – rehabilitation prospects positive if somewhat guarded - special circumstances. On appeal: no error in rejecting unreliable account of offender’s childhood and finding no reduction in moral culpability
27.	<b>RUMSBY (No.6)</b> (30 / 31 at offences – 56 at sentence) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 916</a> RA Hulme AJ	VG Murder  Att choke with intent to sexually assault	27y NPP 19y  10y NPP 7y 6m  <u>Total:</u> 32y NPP 24y		Breached recog – subsequent conviction for indecent assault offences	Asphyxiation  Intent to kill	(1998/1999) Approached 18y female waiting outside house in early hours of morning – punched victim to face, forced her to ground, continued punching and attempted sexual assault – 12 mths later followed 17y female walking home along dark road in early hours of morning – sexually motivated attack – suffocated victim – spontaneous offences – elements of brutal violence Old sentencing patterns applied – facilitation of justice – difficult childhood – physical health issues

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
28.	OWENS [2018] NSWSC 1195 Schmidt J  <a href="#">[2023] NSWCCA 198</a>	PG (38% combined) Murder  2 x Possess stolen firearms  Sched: 3 unrelated offences	<u>Indicative</u> 18y 7m NPP 13y 11m  4y 6m NPP 3y 4m  <u>Aggregate:</u> 22y 6m NPP 16y 11m	AA <u>Indicative</u> 18y 7m NPP 13y 11m  3y 8m  <u>Aggregate:</u> 21y 9m NPP 16y 3m	Record – breached conditional liberty	Stabbing	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> With female partner broke into home of 69y male to steal money – victim fatally stabbed in struggle – body undiscovered in house for one month – offender returned several times during month to steal total \$60,000 – vulnerable victim killed in own home – in company – some planning – mid-range – other offences unrelated Ongoing mental health issues – remorse – assistance On appeal: erred in failure to apply discount to firearms offences
29.	BE (15) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1007</a> RA Hulme AJ  <a href="#">[2024] NSWCCA 100</a>  Co-offender: BL [2024] AD [2024] SIONE [2024] DAWSON [2024]	PG (25%)	15y 6m NPP 10y	AD	Minor	Assault  Intent GBH  Accessorial	One of group of people bashed 16y male victim over 33 minutes – victim suspected of stealing airpods so lured to home of owner – offender one of four who collected victim from station – victim assaulted by adult male in bedroom while offender and others looked on – when adult male left offender and others continued assault – sustained and extremely vicious involving kicking, punching and stomping – attack filmed – offender delivered at least 52 hits, 3 kicks and hair grab Difficult and disadvantaged childhood involving violence, neglect and exposure to alcohol and drug abuse – exposure to gang culture - uncontrollable behaviour, ADHD and Conduct Disorder – genuine remorse but continued violence in detention makes assessment of rehabilitation prospects difficult – some family support TB [2024] sentenced for manslaughter On appeal: no errors made and sentence not manifestly excessive

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
30.	<p><b>CHAMMA</b> (30)</p> <p><b>HICKS</b> (34)</p> <p><a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1057</a> McNaughton J</p>	<p>VG</p> <p>VG</p>	<p>21y NPP 15y 9m</p> <p>23y NPP 16y</p>		<p>Driving, drugs, firearms, violence.</p> <p>Violence</p>	<p>Stabbed</p> <p>Accessorial liability</p>	<p><b>SNPP 20 years</b> Joint criminal enterprise – killing during armed robbery - H, C and co-offender S arrived at victim's home to commit robbery – H armed with knife - deceased stabbed by H multiple times – offenders left with \$9k - intention to cause grievous bodily harm - robbery opportunistic after C learnt from S that deceased had significant amount of money and jewellery at his house - H formed intention to rob at the suggestion of C - level of methylamphetamine in deceased's blood cannot exclude reasonable possibility deceased agitated and aggressive when confronted with H wielding knife. C: good upbringing - associating with people met in jail - depression and anxiety - no remorse – some real prospects of rehabilitation. H: illicit drug use, alcohol use from 12y - mild range intellectual disability, personality disorder and substance abuse disorder - special circumstances – no remorse – guarded rehabilitation</p>
31.	<p><b>EARLY (No.8)</b> (41 at offence – 77 at sentence) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1222</a> Yehia J</p>	VG	22y NPP 15y 6m		On bail at time of offence – history of sexual offences prior to 1991	<p>Assault</p> <p>Intent GBH</p> <p>Accessorial liability</p>	<p>(1987) Party to agreement by group of males to assault victim and cause really serious harm in park with reputation as 'gay beat' – vulnerable victim alone in park in early hours of morning – chased and assaulted by group – multiple injuries - motivated by hatred or prejudice against homosexual males – previously involved in group assaults on males in same park Advanced age – mental health issues – sexually assaulted in boys homes and prison – no remorse - some prospects of rehabilitation – unlikely to re-offend</p>
32.	<p><b>NIGUIDULA</b> (43) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1283</a> Dhanji J</p>	<p>VG Murder</p> <p>PG AOABH</p>	<p>16y NPP 12y</p> <p>s.10A conviction</p>		nil	<p>Stabbing</p> <p>Intent GBH</p>	<p><b>SNPP 20 years</b> Travelled with victim from USA for business purposes - intimate relationship – victim also employee of offender - angry and emotional upon learning of victim's affair – struck victim with lamp – later single stabbing to chest in shower – impulsive – lower end of range – context of domestic relationship and employment relationship made victim vulnerable Female - borderline personality disorder significantly impacted offence and will impact custodial conditions – some remorse – facilitated trial process – good prospects of rehabilitation</p>

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
33.	<b>RATKE</b> (73) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1310</a> Weinstein J	PG (25%)	17y 3m NPP 11y		Negligible	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed wife of 50 years 17 times while in bed – bizarre, senseless and tragic – some planning – breach of mutual trust – isolated incident of domestic violence – financial pressure – offence committed in victim’s home – approaching mid-range Suffering major depressive illness reducing moral culpability – remorse – co-operation with police – physical and mental ailments and age make custodial conditions hard
34.	<b>TIRIAKI</b> (21 at offence) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1480</a> Rothman J	PG (12.5%)	17y 6m NPP 11y 8m		Unremarkable – driving, assault and break and enter	Shooting  Accessorial liability  Constructive murder	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> (2011) Broke into home of victim with co-offender in order to commit specially aggravated kidnapping – co-offender shot victim once to chest – offender did not encourage shooting or contemplate death – aware co-offender carrying ‘something to protect them’ – aware people in house – presence of children – co-offender sentenced for manslaughter Family support – sound prospects of rehabilitation and reduced risk of re-offending - youth
35.	<b>ALLEN</b> (39) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1495</a> Fagan J	VG	22y NPP 15y 9m		Lengthy including multiple offences of violence and subsequent offence of reckless wounding	Stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed male victim once to chest during attempted robbery at door of victim’s caravan – sought to rob victim of drugs or money – expected victim to resist so armed self with knife – co-offender waiting in car. Difficult childhood with exposure to violence, sexual abuse, early drug use, out of home care, poor education and neglect – significant substance abuse – mental health issues – no real indication of remorse

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
36.	VUJICA (25) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1532</a> Sweeney J	VG	19y NPP 14y		Assault, assault law officer, assault GBH, assault ABH.	Stabbing  Intent GBH	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Held male victim responsible for loss of \$50 for purchase of drugs – offender illogical, as victim had not taken his money - approached victim with friend – victim picked up brick, in self-defence – offender threw haymaker punch towards victim's head - holding small knife blade attached to key ring, stabbed victim in neck – offender left scene and burned clothes he had been wearing - not planned or premeditated - just below midrange objective seriousness. Mental health - anxiety disorder - post-traumatic stress disorder - likely increased subjective perception of threat from victim.
37.	AS (46) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1575</a> Wilson J	VG	18y NPP 12y 6m		Nil	Shaking  Reckless indifference	<b>SNPP 25 years</b> Shook son, 9m old baby, causing severe brain injury that was the direct cause of death one month later – victim at home with offender – wife returned home to find offender holding victim unresponsive - lost temper, briefly shaking victim - admissions to neighbours immediately after incident, but has since never acknowledged what he had done. No remorse - good character, strong work ethic - rehabilitation prospects reasonably positive. Afghanistan background – trauma - Post Traumatic Stress Disorder.
38.	HOSSAIN (49) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1621</a> Chen J	PG (25%)	19y 6m NPP 14y 7m		Nil	Stabbing  Intent to kill	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Stabbed wife at least 80 times during argument in garage of family home at night – ferocious attack with great deal of violence – retrieved large knife from kitchen – no clear motive – knew death would deprive children of mother Unlikely to re-offend – not satisfied of remorse – depressive illness provides small reduction in moral culpability – physical health issues

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

	NAME (age if known)	PLEA	SENTENCE	APPEAL	SUMMARY OF RECORD	HOW KILLED	INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY
39.	DOWLING (35) <a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1620</a> RA Hulme AJ	PG (25%)	22y 6m NPP 16y 10m		Significant – breached parole – includes personal violence	Assault  Recklessness	<b>SNPP 20 years</b> Assaulted frail 65y male victim during sexual foreplay – ‘on and off’ relationship – degree of trust – forced dentures down throat of victim causing asphyxiation – left body in offender’s room in boarding house for four days – callous indifference – not pre-mediated but prior violence – context of domestic relationship Remorse not established – mental health and substance abuse issues – childhood trauma involving exposure to substance abuse, violence and sexual abuse

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.