

|  |
|--|
| <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Murder</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Victims Under 18 years – Since 2000</b></p> |
|--|

**Maximum Penalty:** Life (s.19A (NSW) Crimes Act)

**Standard non-parole period** (offences committed on or after 1.2.2003)

20 years

**Standard non-parole period** (where conviction entered or plea of guilty made on or after 1.1.2008)

25 years - Where the victim a child under 18 years of age

|    | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA                                     | SENTENCE  | APPEAL                        | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD     | HOW KILLED                      | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|----|---|--|---|-------------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------------------|---|
| 1. | <b>DE GRUCHY</b><br>(2000) 110 A Crim R 271<br><a href="#">[2000] NSWCCA 51</a>   | VG<br>3 x murder                         | MT 21y<br>AT 7y<br>(concurrent)                               | Conviction AD                 |                          | assaulted with<br>heavy weapons | Killed mother, sister and brother in home - no motive for killings.   |
| 2. | <b>PARK</b><br>(30)<br>NSWSC 3.8.2000<br>Sperling J<br><br><a href="#">[2003] NSWCCA 203</a><br><a href="#">[2003] NSWCCA 142</a> | VG<br>Murder<br><br>Murder<br><br>Murder | 26y<br>NPP 19y 6m<br><br>FT 15y<br><br>FT 15y<br>(concurrent) | Conviction AD<br><br>Crown AD |                          | suffocation<br><br>intent kill  | Suffocated wife and two infant children and dumped bodies in bushland - highly charged emotional state at time of killing. Some remorse - admissions shortened trial - protective custody   |
| 3. | <b>O'GRADY</b><br>(16y 9m)<br><a href="#">[2000] NSWSC 1255</a><br>Hulme J  | VG                                       | 15y<br>NPP 10y  |                               | no significant<br>record | shooting                        | Led 15y male acquaintance into bush area and shot with rifle and silencer 9 times - voluntarily surrendered to police - no rational explanation for offence.<br>Displayed genuine remorse and shame - long history of drug abuse - desensitised to violence but no actual history of violence - impulsive - degree of depersonalisation at time of offence - general deterrence limited value |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|    | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA   | SENTENCE   | APPEAL  | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD | HOW KILLED                                     | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|----|---|--|--|---|----------------------|--|---|
| 4. | <b>CIKOS</b><br><a href="#">[2001] NSWSC 35</a><br>Dunford J  | PG<br>(10-15%)<br>3 x Murder                             | 21y<br>NPP 15y 6m<br>(concurrent)                          |   | nil                  | suffocation /<br>assault<br><br>intent to kill | Killed de facto and sons aged 4 years and 18 months old - passive man who endured months of aggression and abuse at hands of dominant de facto wife - reacted to de facto's ultimatum that he kill de facto's friend by certain date. Genuine remorse - strict protection   |
| 5. | <b>MCINTYRE</b><br>(44)<br><a href="#">[2001] NSWSC 500</a><br>Bell J<br><br><a href="#">[2002] NSWCCA 29</a>                                       | VG   | 22y<br>NPP 17y   | AD  | negligible           | stabbing<br><br>intent to kill                 | Stabbed 14y boy in neck and chest - disposed of body in bushland after cutting off penis and scrotum and attempting to saw off leg - motive unclear - not premeditated. Socially isolated lifestyle - family support.   |
| 6. | <b>CHEATHAM</b><br><a href="#">[2001] NSWSC 580</a><br>Grove J<br><br><a href="#">[2002] NSWCCA 360</a>   | VG<br>Murder<br><br>Murder<br><br>Wound w/i to<br>murder | 24y<br>NPP 16y<br><br>FT 16y<br><br>FT 12y<br>(concurrent) | AA<br>22y<br>NPP 14y<br><br>FT 14y<br><br>FT 12y<br>(concurrent)                  |                      | stabbing                                       | Stabbed wife and 3y daughter to death and attempted to stab baby to death - believed he was suffering from AIDS and had infected family. Protective custody because worked in juvenile justice system – retrial   |
| 7. | <b>SLD</b><br>(13y 10m)<br><a href="#">[2002] NSWSC 758</a><br>Wood CJ at CL<br><br>(2003) 142 A Crim R<br>503<br><a href="#">[2003] NSWCCA 310</a> | PG   | 20y<br>NPP 10y   | AD  |                      | stabbing<br><br>intent to kill                 | Broke into neighbouring home at night and abducted 3y sleeping girl - removed clothes and stabbed her in chest once - discarded body in long grass - misled police during inquiries - callous and cold-blooded killing - motive unclear. Seriously affected by background of upheaval, abuse and lack of emotional support - intellectual and speech disability and dysmorphic appearance - sexually abused by half-brother - disturbed individual - history of aggressive and unacceptable behaviour - significant level of future dangerousness, although difficult to assess at this stage |
| 8. | <b>MERRITT</b><br>(30)<br><a href="#">[2002] NSWSC 1159</a><br>Greg James J<br><br>(2004) 146 A Crim R<br>309<br><a href="#">[2004] NSWCCA 19</a>   | PG<br>(15% on<br>appeal)<br>2 x Murder<br><br>Murder     | Life   | AA<br>24y<br>NPP 18y<br><br>24y<br>NPP 17y<br><br><u>Total:</u><br>34y<br>NPP 27y | minor                | suffocation<br><br>intent to kill              | Father killed his 3 children aged 11w, 11m and 6y on custody visit - no explanation for killing - incomprehensible action - no evidence of mental disorder. On appeal: objective gravity of offence justified life sentence but insufficient weight given to depressive state – sentence patterns show life not imposed in cases of parents murdering children.   |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.



|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA                                 | SENTENCE  | APPEAL        | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD   | HOW KILLED                                    | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY  |
|-----|---|--------------------------------------|---|---------------|--|---|--|
| 12. | <b>MS</b><br>(17)<br><a href="#">[2004] NSWSC 730</a><br>Dunford J  | VG                                   | 17y<br>NPP 11y                                  |               | Lengthy record<br>including<br>common assault<br>and mal<br>wounding | Strangulation<br><br>Intent to kill           | Killed 15y girlfriend by strangling her with shoelaces – relationship marked by violence towards victim<br>Aboriginal youth – physically abused and dislocated throughout childhood – alcohol and drug addiction – good prospects of rehabilitation  |
| 13. | <b>VANN</b><br>(20)<br><a href="#">[2004] NSWSC 988</a><br>Dunford J  | PG<br>(13%)<br>Murder<br><br>Assault | 19y<br>NPP 14y 3m<br><br>FT 18m<br>(concurrent) |               | Possess knife in<br>public place                                     | Shooting<br><br>Intent to kill                | Shot 16y male stranger with SKS rifle during fight outside cinema – called to cinema to assist   |
| 14. | <b>O'CONNELL</b><br>(18)<br><a href="#">[2004] NSWSC 1120</a><br>Davidson AJ<br><br><a href="#">[2006] NSWCCA 82</a>  | PG<br>(20%)                          | 35y<br>NPP 25y                                  | AD            | Juvenile record<br>for serious<br>crimes of<br>violence              | Assault and<br>stabbing<br><br>Intent to kill | Killed 15y girl with whom he was having casual relationship – horrific wounds – 49 injuries, including 10 stab wounds - violent sexual proclivities – disposed of body in nearby garbage bin – deliberately attempted to divert suspicion<br>Victim of abuse by stepfathers – drug and alcohol problems – dyslexia/ADHD – remorse – youth – but for youth and plea, life sentence would have been imposed – limited protective custody |
| 15. | <b>COULTER</b><br>(41)<br><a href="#">[2005] NSWSC 101</a><br>G. James J  | PG                                   | Life  |               | Nil  | Suffocation<br><br>intent to kill             | <b>SNPP 20 years</b><br>Killed 11y daughter of cousin – planned to kill so would be forced to commit suicide – smothered victim in her home – took body to bushland and grossly mutilated body before genuine attempt at suicide – carefully planned<br>Suffering severe depression, pervasive and intrusive violent thoughts and obsessive compulsive disorder – lifelong mental disorder   |
| 16. | <b>MAH</b><br>(17y 10m - 22 at<br>sentence)<br><a href="#">[2005] NSWSC 871</a><br>Hislop J<br><br><a href="#">[2006] NSWCCA 226</a><br><br>Co-offender:<br>JSK | VG                                   | 22y<br>NPP 16y 6m                               | Crown AD / AD | neg driving  | Assault<br><br>Intent to kill                 | Fatal assault on 17y friend - principal - friend taken to remote area and body buried – pre-meditation<br>Good employment history – supportive family – denies all involvement   |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA   | SENTENCE   | APPEAL  | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD   | HOW KILLED  | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|---|--|--|---|------------------------|---|---|
| 17. | <b>JALATY</b><br>(30-31)<br><a href="#">[2006] NSWSC 675</a><br>Grove J   | VG<br>Murder<br><br>Mal Admin<br>noxious thing | 20y<br>NPP 15y<br><br>FT 5y<br>(concurrent)  |   | Not relevant           | Ingestion of<br>methadone<br><br>Reckless<br>indifference | <b>SNPP 20 years</b><br>Female dosed 3y daughter with methadone causing cardiac<br>respiratory arrest – 3 months later dosed daughter again<br>causing death – attempting to control behaviour and keep<br>child asleep during liaison with male friend<br>Difficult life with rape, forced marriages and serious back<br>injuries from car accident – acute loneliness – drug addiction<br>from back injuries – protective custody – chronic back pain |
| 18. | <b>F.A.P</b><br>(24)<br><a href="#">[2007] NSWSC 905</a><br>Howie J   | PG<br>(10%)<br><br>Murder                      | 19y 6m<br>NPP 14y 6m   |   | Record                 | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH                                 | <b>SNPP 20 years</b><br>Caused fatal head injury to 15m son – admitted abusing son<br>physically over week preceding death – frustrated by victim's<br>crying and behaviour – unplanned offence – slightly below<br>mid-range of seriousness<br>Aboriginal male - deprived and troubled upbringing –<br>immature and low intellectual ability   |
| 19. | <b>DN</b><br>(24)<br><a href="#">[2007] NSWSC 1252</a><br>Hidden J  | PG<br>(20%)<br>Murder<br><br>Att murder        | 20y<br>NPP 15y<br><br>12y NPP 8y<br><br><u>Total</u><br>25y<br>NPP 20y             |   | Nil                    | Stabbing  | <b>SNPP 20 years</b><br>Stabbed partner in face – fatally stabbed 11y stepson – no<br>explanation for uncharacteristic attack or violent rage –<br>intoxicated and suffering cannabis withdrawal and<br>depression – above mid- range<br>Aboriginal male - no history for violence – deep remorse   |
| 20. | <b>RHB</b><br>(25 / 37 at offences -<br>41 at sentence)<br><a href="#">[2007] NSWSC 1466</a><br>Hall J<br><br>(2008) 189 A Crim R<br>178<br><a href="#">[2008] NSWCCA 236</a> | VG<br>Manslaughter<br><br>Murder               | 6y<br>NPP 4y 6m<br><br>30y<br>NPP 20y<br><br><u>Total:</u><br>34y 6m<br>NPP 24y 6m | Crown AD<br>AA<br>6y<br>NPP 4y 6m<br><br>26y 8m<br>NPP 20y<br><br><u>Total:</u><br>31y 2m<br>NPP 24y 6m | Minor – no<br>violence | Assault<br><br>Either intent to<br>kill or GBH            | <b>SNPP 20 years</b><br>Killed 14m step son – traumatic injuries to head –<br>circumstances of killing unclear – 12y later killed 2y son of<br>sister in law – traumatic head injury – circumstances unclear<br>– both children in care of offender – unlawful and dangerous<br>act manslaughter  |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA   | SENTENCE   | APPEAL   | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD  | HOW KILLED   | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY  |
|-----|---|--|--|--|---|--|--|
| 21. | <b>DL</b><br>(16)<br><a href="#">[2008] NSWSC 1199</a><br>Hulme J<br><br><a href="#">[2017] NSWCCA 58</a><br><br><a href="#">[2018] HCA 32</a><br><br><a href="#">[2018] NSWCCA 302</a> | VG   | 22y<br>NPP 17y                                   | AD<br><br>HCA<br>Sentence AA<br>Remitted for re-sentence<br><br>18y<br>NPP 13y | Nil   | Stabbing<br><br>Intent GBH                                 | <b>SNPP 25years</b><br>Stabbed 15y school girl walking home from school 48 times – frenzied killing – no explanation for attack – irrational – premeditation not established – intent to kill not established – uncharacteristic – possible psychotic episode – little below mid-range<br>Suffering anxiety and depression – declined to discuss offence claiming innocence  |
| 22. | <b>PJS</b><br>(33)<br><a href="#">[2009] NSWSC 153</a><br>Mathews AJ  | VG   | 26y<br>NPP 20y                                   |  | Lengthy record<br>– breached<br>bonds                       | Assault  | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Severe assault of 3y step daughter left at home with offender and 9y sister when mother went to refuge – assaulted all over head and body – intoxicated – no recollection – position of trust – above mid-range<br>Violent childhood – protective custody – violent relationship with wife   |
| 23. | <b>WALSH</b><br>(69)<br><a href="#">[2009] NSWSC 764</a><br>McCallum J  | PG<br>2 x Murder<br><br>Murder<br><br>Att murder | Life<br><br>20y<br>NPP 15y<br><br>16y<br>NPP 12y |  | Nil   | Assault,<br>stabbing and<br>drowning<br><br>Intent to kill | <b>SNPP 20 years / 25 years</b><br>Grandfather hit wife with hammer and stabbed her to death – drowned 5y granddaughter in bath – assaulted 7y grandson with hammer then drowned in bath – bodies placed in bed – killed dog – children in care of grandparents while mother at work – lied to school about children being ill – assaulted daughter with axe when she returned– brain and skull injuries – planning and premeditation – high degree of violence - no explanation for killings – murder of wife mid-range – assault on daughter well above mid-range<br>No mental illness |
| 24. | <b>MEHTA</b><br>(42)<br><a href="#">[2009] NSWSC 814</a><br>Grove J   | PG<br>Murder<br><br>Murder                       | 30y<br><br>Life                                  |  | Assault on first<br>wife – strangling<br>and threat to kill | Strangulation<br><br>Intent to kill                        | <b>SNPP 20 years / 25 years</b><br>Strangled wife during argument – verbal threats and physical assaults made previously – killed 9y step daughter to prevent her reporting killing to police – method of killing unclear – threw bodies over cliff in Blue Mountains – discovered by bushwalkers four weeks later – lied to police – had son assist in deception - killed wife for financial reasons<br>No evidence of remorse or rehabilitation  |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)   | PLEA                                      | SENTENCE                                    | APPEAL                               | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD   | HOW KILLED                     | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|--|---|---|--------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------|---|
| 25. | <b>SW (No 3)</b><br>(34)<br><a href="#">[2009] NSWSC 1043</a><br>Hulme J<br><br><a href="#">[2013] NSWCCA 103</a>                                      | VG  | Life  | AA<br>40y<br>NPP 30y                 | Nil  | Starvation –<br>neglect        | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Mother of 7y daughter who died as a result of starvation and neglect – daughter suffered developmental delay and autism – left in bedroom in unhygienic conditions - worst case<br>Drug use – difficult personal history including possible domestic abuse within relationships – expert psychiatric evidence identified abnormal personality traits<br>Father [BW] sentenced for manslaughter.<br>On appeal: in view of expert psychiatric evidence did not come in worst case category  |
| 26. | <b>DENNIS</b><br>(19)<br><a href="#">[2009] NSWSC 1357</a><br>Barr AJ<br><br><a href="#">[2012] NSWCCA 120</a><br><br><a href="#">[2015] NSWCCA 61</a> | VG  | 26y 8m<br>NPP 20y                           | Conviction AD<br><br><br>Sentence AD | Nil  | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH      | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Assaulted 23m son of girlfriend while in his care – hit head with blunt instrument or forced head against wall – placed child back in cot – spontaneous offence – circumstances of offence unclear<br>Exemplary character – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – protective custody   |
| 27. | <b>PFITZNER</b><br>(26)<br><a href="#">[2009] NSWSC 1267</a><br>RA Hulme J<br><br><a href="#">[2010] NSWCCA 314</a>                                    | PG<br>(15%)                               | 25y 6m<br>NPP 19y 2m                        | AD                                   | Breached<br>suspended<br>sentence for mal<br>inflict GBH in<br>company – other<br>offences | Asphyxiation<br><br>Intent GBH | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Female - mistreated, abused and assaulted 2y son over long period of time – murdered victim by asphyxiation although actual method of killing unclear – wrapped body in plastic, placed in suitcase and threw in nearby pond – spontaneous offence giving in to anger and influenced by several factors and pressures – had declined to give up victim to custody of mother or DOCS despite asking for help – aware victim about to be returned to lawful guardian - slightly below mid-range.<br>Displayed appropriate parenting to two other children |
| 28. | <b>LANE</b><br>(21 at offence - 36 at sentence)<br><a href="#">[2011] NSWSC 289</a><br>Whealy J<br><br><a href="#">[2013] NSWCCA 317</a>               | VG<br>Murder<br><br>3 x False<br>swearing | 18y<br>NPP 13y 5m<br><br>9m<br>(concurrent) | Conviction AD                        | nil  | Unknown<br><br>Intent to kill  | (1996) Mother disposed of 2-day old daughter – body never found and no information as to circumstances of or motive for killing – killing relatively spontaneous – suffering disordered personality - false swearing offences related to false information contained in affidavits used for adoption of other children – birth of daughter and two other children kept secret from friends and family<br>Strong character testimonials – rehabilitation – mother to 9y daughter – low level of protective custody   |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)   | PLEA  | SENTENCE   | APPEAL   | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD                         | HOW KILLED                | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|--|---|--|--|--|---------------------------|---|
| 29. | <b>DA-PRA</b><br>(48)<br><a href="#">[2012] NSWSC 607</a><br>RS Hulme J<br><br><a href="#">[2014] NSWCCA 211</a>                               | VG<br>Murder<br><br>Attempt<br>murder<br><br>(Mansl at first<br>instance) | 15y<br>NPP 10y<br><br>6y NPP 4y 6m<br><br>6y NPP 4y 6m<br><br><u>Total</u><br>20y<br>NPP 15y | Conviction AA<br>Crown AA<br>20y<br>NPP 13y<br><br>10y NPP 7y 6m<br><br><u>Total</u><br>25y<br>NPP 19y | Nil  | Stabbed                   | <b>SNPP 20 years / 25 years</b><br>Suffocated father (manslaughter) – believed bikies were after him causing argument with father - ran next door to neighbours' home - attacked 12y female cutting her throat (murder) – also attacked mother and cut her throat (attempt murder) - unclear why attacked neighbours – did not attend house with intent to kill<br>Schizophrenia - chronic cannabis use – no prior violence – reliable employee – remorse – attempted suicide – no possibility of reoffending<br>On appeal: manslaughter quashed on grounds of mental illness   |
| 30. | <b>MILAT</b><br>(17)<br><br><b>KLEIN</b><br>(18)<br><br><a href="#">[2012] NSWSC 634</a><br>Mathews AJ<br><br><a href="#">[2014] NSWCCA 29</a> | PG<br>(No discount)<br><br>PG<br>(CCA – 25%)                              | 43y<br>NPP 30y<br><br>32y<br>NPP 22y   | AD<br><br>AA<br>27y<br>NPP 20y   | Mid-range PCA<br><br>No violence             | Axe<br><br>Intent to kill | <b>SNPP 25 years (for Klein only)</b><br>Offenders and another friend invited victim to accompany them to Belanglo Forest – M took double sided axe from vehicle and struck victim in torso and to back of head – killing recorded by K on mobile phone - “thrill kill” – planned and premeditated - in company - gratuitous cruelty.<br>M - personality dysfunctions and lack of empathy - poses substantial risk of violent re-offending - serious potential danger to community – no remorse – worst case category murder<br>K – impressionable and strongly influenced by M - no psych illness - prospects of rehabilitation at least moderate and more favourable – within serious range                           |
| 31. | <b>ABRAHAMS</b><br>(27)<br><a href="#">[2013] NSWSC 952</a><br>Harrison J  | PG<br>(10%)<br>Murder<br><br>Interference<br>with body                    | 21y 6m<br>NPP 15y<br><br>FT 18m<br><br><u>Total:</u><br>22y 6m<br>NPP 16y                    |  | Personal<br>violence order<br>against victim | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Female - murder of 6y daughter – in 2010 reported daughter missing – in 2011 took police to gravesite with partner - victim suffered repeated injuries in months prior to death – fractured teeth just prior to death suggesting blunt force trauma and being punched in upward direction – offender and partner had placed body in suitcase then placed in hole in remote area – partner poured petrol over body and burnt it - mid-range objective seriousness.<br>Borderline disabled intellectual range – dysfunctional and disruptive upbringing – upbringing in violent household – Aboriginal female.<br>Partner sentenced for manslaughter - <u>Smith</u> [2013] NSWSC 796 per Latham J |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.



|     | NAME<br>(age if known)   | PLEA   | SENTENCE   | APPEAL               | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD         | HOW KILLED                             | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY  |
|-----|--|--|--|----------------------|------------------------------|--|--|
| 32. | <b>MBELE</b><br>(22)<br><a href="#">[2013] NSWSC 1394</a><br>Latham J<br><br><a href="#">[2021] NSWCCA 182</a> | VG   | 26y<br>NPP 18y   | AA<br>23y<br>NPP 16y | Breached bond<br>for assault | Stabbing<br><br>Intent GBH             | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Stabbed 16y during confrontation at railway station in early evening – earlier confrontation with victim – members of opposing groups – angry – deliberately antagonised victim to provoke confrontation – single stab to chest – ‘cowardly, vicious, vengeful and premeditated attack’<br>On appeal found error in failing to consider impact of PTSD on custodial conditions<br>On re-sentence – negative impact of PTSD and Covid on custodial conditions – limited treatment for PTSD – remorse – better prospects of rehabilitation – continued family support  |
| 33. | <b>BELL</b><br>(27)<br><a href="#">[2013] NSWSC 1838</a><br>Hall J   | PG<br>(10%)<br>Murder<br><br>s97(2)<br><br>s33(1)(a) | 25y 4m<br>NPP 19y<br><br>5y NPP 3y 9m<br><br>10y NPP 7y 6m<br><br><u>Total:</u><br>27y<br>NPP 21y 6m |                      | Rob in co,<br>AOABH, drugs   | Shooting<br><br>Constructive<br>murder | <b>SNPP 20 years</b><br>Home invasion with co-offender to obtain money and drugs – armed with firearms – during struggle accidentally shot in face by co-offender – offender discharged his firearm killing male aged 17y – co-offender shot and injured second male - intent to inflict injury for purpose of effecting escape - did not form intent to shoot until very shortly before fatal shot fired<br>Left school Year 8 – learning difficulties - long standing personal problems including drug use and anti-social personality characteristics - no link established between anti-social personality disorder and any abusive or deprived upbringing |
| 34. | <b>FAZAH</b><br>(32)<br><a href="#">[2014] NSWSC 231</a><br>Hidden J   | PG<br>(25%)<br>Murder<br><br>s.33                    | 24y<br>NPP 18y<br><br>7y NPP 5y<br><br><u>Total:</u><br>26y<br>NPP 20y                               |                      | nil                          | Stabbing<br><br>Intent to kill         | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>After assaulting wife in unit chased her down stairs and stabbed her multiple times – returned to unit and fatally stabbed 2y daughter – offender stabbed himself – spontaneous offence<br>Troubled relationship – history of violence towards wife – suffered wartime conditions, capture and torture in Afghanistan – PTSD – custodial conditions more onerous because of personal history   |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA         | SENTENCE                           | APPEAL                | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD | HOW KILLED                               | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|---|--------------|------------------------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|--|---|
| 35. | <b>ROSS</b><br>(29)<br><a href="#">[2014] NSWSC 707</a><br>Rothman J<br><br><a href="#">[2016] NSWCCA 176</a>                                 | VG           | 40y<br>NPP 30y                     | AD                    | BES - assault        | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH                | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Killed 2y daughter of de facto- mistreated child during two months prior to death – forced her into cold shower and hit her head against shower screen – kicked collapsed child forcing her head to hit linen cupboard – injured child left in pram unattended for night and day – unplanned and unpremeditated<br>Bipolar disorder and high-level personality disorder – heavy smoker of cannabis – difficult childhood – Aboriginal male - no relevant Fernando considerations – no remorse |
| 36. | <b>HILL</b><br>(33)<br><a href="#">[2014] NSWSC 1010</a><br>Bellew J  | PG<br>(10%)  | 27y 6m<br>NPP 20y 6m               |                       | nil                  | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH                | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Killed 2y son of de facto – physically abused victim over many months – fractured skull and gastric tear caused by two separate blows – significant force used – would have been aware of pain caused by first blow to stomach – second blow inflicted several hours later – spontaneous and unplanned – slightly above mid-range<br>Back injuries causing persistent pain - depression   |
| 37. | <b>McARTHUR</b><br><a href="#">[2014] NSWSC 1401</a><br>Harrison J  | PG<br>(10%)  | 25y 2m<br>NPP 18y 10m              |                       |                      | Stabbing<br><br>Intent GBH               | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Stabbed 15y male outside industrial premises – mistook victim for his father – offender made an offer by a 'mate' to 'rough up' and assault person who owed money – would be paid in drugs – had never seen victim or his father before – stabbed victim to chest – planned offence – armed with weapon - above mid-range.<br>Drug user<br>Co-Accused Robertson sentenced for manslaughter  |
| 38. | <b>SB</b><br>(16)<br><br><b>AE</b><br>(16)<br><br><a href="#">[2015] NSWSC 659</a><br>Hall J<br><br>(AE)<br><a href="#">[2016] NSWCCA 228</a> | VG<br><br>VG | 12y<br>NPP 8y<br><br>12y<br>NPP 8y | <br><br>Conviction AD | Nil<br><br>Nil       | Assault<br><br>Joint criminal enterprise | Part of group of males involved in bashing and fatal assault of 17y male at party – group kicked and bashed victim – struck on head by co-offender JP with wine bottle causing death.<br>Each offender had favourable rehabilitation and strong subjective circumstances.   |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA  | SENTENCE   | APPEAL        | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD                          | HOW KILLED  | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY  |
|-----|---|---|--|---------------|---|---|--|
| 39. | <b>MAYBIR (No.8)</b><br>(29)<br><a href="#">[2016] NSWSC 166</a><br>RA Hulme J                              | VG<br>Murder<br><br>s.61O(2A)<br><br>5 x s.61<br><br>2 x s.91H(2)<br><br>s.35(3)<br><br>s.59(1) | <u>Indicative</u><br>38y<br>NPP 28y 6m<br><br>1y<br><br>2y / 1y / 1y 3m<br><br>2y / 1y<br><br>4y NPP 3y<br><br>1y<br><br><u>Aggregate</u><br>42y<br>NPP 31y 6m |               | Breached bond<br>imposed for<br>breaching AVO | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH                                   | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Lived with partner and her young children in small music studio – enforced physical discipline over many months particularly on 7y male victim suffering intellectual disability – cruel, degrading and inhumane treatment – victim died as result of blunt force trauma to head although exact manner of death unclear – failed to obtain medical treatment   |
| 40. | <b>XIE</b><br>(53)<br><a href="#">[2017] NSWSC 63</a><br>Fullerton J<br><br><a href="#">[2021] NSWCCA 1</a> | VG<br>5 x Murder  | Life   | Conviction AD |   | Assault with<br>hammer-like<br>weapon<br><br>Intent to kill | <b>SNPP 20 years / 25 years</b><br>Killed wife's brother and his wife, her sister and their 12y and 9y sons and wife's sister – all victims killed in same house at night – severe and targeted assault to heads and faces of victims with hammer-like weapon - attached rope to weapon to maximise degree of force and ensure victims killed with speed and efficiency – planning – possible motive of sexual interest in 15y daughter of victim (not present in house on night of killing) or upset with low status in family - spread and severity of injuries - multiple forms of extreme violence<br>Risk of future violent offending amplified by sexual violence inflicted on victims' daughter after murders |

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA  | SENTENCE   | APPEAL                                       | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD       | HOW KILLED   | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|---|---|--|--|----------------------------|--|---|
| 41. | <b>RHODES</b><br>(35)<br><a href="#">[2017] NSWSC 964</a><br>Campbell J   | PG<br>(25%)<br>Murder<br><br>Murder<br><br>Assault<br><br>Assault police<br><br>Sched:<br>Property<br>damage<br>Resist arrest | <u>Indicative</u><br>24y<br>NPP 18y<br><br>30y<br>NPP 22y 6m<br><br>14m<br><br>2y<br><br><u>Total:</u><br>40y<br>NPP 30y |  | Violence against<br>mother | Assault and<br>stabbing<br><br>Intent to kill            | <b>SNPP 20 years / SNPP 25 years</b><br>Returned home after drinking and using drugs during day – ice-induced psychosis – chased mother out of house stabbing her multiple times then crushing skull with concrete statue – returned to house and stabbed young male relative in chest with knife – threw him against wall and chased him outside smashing his head with sandstone paver – sustained and persistent although spontaneous assaults – approached and threatened female stranger in her car – threatened male police officer with fibro-cement meter cover – offences conducted in presence of other young children – home of victims – abuse of trust – well above midrange offences<br>Aboriginal male - abusive father – long history of drug addictions – suffering ADHD and dyslexia resulting in easy recourse to violence when angry – some remorse |
| 42. | <b>LOCK (TL)</b><br>(27)<br><a href="#">[2017] NSWSC 715</a><br>Latham J<br><br><a href="#">[2020] NSWCCA 265</a>   | VG  | 36y<br>NPP 27y   | AD   | Minor                      | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH                                | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Bashed 2y child of de facto partner - blunt force trauma caused massive internal bleeding leading to death – history of assaults on victim - more than moderately above mid-range   |
| 43. | <b>LN</b><br>(40)<br><br><b>AW</b><br>(45)<br><a href="#">[2017] NSWSC 1387</a><br>Johnson J<br><br>(LN)<br><a href="#">[2020] NSWCCA 131</a><br><br>(AW)<br><a href="#">[2025] NSWCCA 47</a> | VG<br><br>VG  | 44y<br>NPP 33y<br><br>40y<br>NPP 30y   | AA<br>38y<br>NPP 28y 6m<br><br>Conviction AD | Nil<br><br>limited         | Assault<br><br>Intent to kill (LN)<br><br>Accessory (AW) | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>LN mother of 3y male victim - AW stepfather and LN's partner - LN killed child – AW guilty by extended joint criminal enterprise – victim assaulted over 51-day period before murder – extensive emotional and physical abuse – fatal injuries committed by LN attacking victim - substantial acceleration/deceleration forces - pattern of assaults taken into consideration in assessing objective seriousness<br>LN: objective seriousness very significantly above mid-range – mental illness - troubled background - drug and alcohol abuse – no insight into offence – no remorse or contrition<br>AW: objective seriousness significantly above mid-range - no remorse or contrition<br>CCA (LN): error in relation to effect of offender's mental illness on moral culpability  |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA   | SENTENCE  | APPEAL        | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD  | HOW KILLED                    | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|---|--|---|---------------|---|-------------------------------|---|
| 44. | <b>TERKMANI</b><br>(21)<br><a href="#">[2017] NSWSC 1567</a><br>McCallum J  | VG<br>Murder<br><br>s.61J  | <u>Indicative</u><br>40y<br>NPP 30y<br><br>20y<br>NPP 15y<br><br><u>Aggregate</u><br>45y<br>NPP 33y |               | Numerous<br>offences<br>involving<br>unprovoked<br>violence –<br>breached strict<br>bail conditions<br>for serious drug<br>offences | Assault<br><br>Intent to kill | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Bashed to death 16y male friend in abandoned house – sustained, brutal and horrific attack using variety of household items as weapons – strangled victim – repeatedly thrust handle of squeegee into anus as far as stomach wall – offences appear spontaneous – motive impossible to discern<br>Offences extreme enough to warrant maximum penalty but declined to impose life sentence due to youth  |
| 45. | <b>JK</b><br>(31)<br><a href="#">[2018] NSWSC 250</a><br>Hamill J   | PG<br>(slightly more<br>than 10%)<br>Murder<br><br>Sched:<br>Inflict GBH | 37y 6m<br>NPP 28y   |               | Minor   | Assault<br><br>Intent to GBH  | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Killing of 12y step-daughter following sustained beatings over several days – horrific injuries through blunt force trauma – history of regular and increasingly violent assaults - tied to garage beam by hands and hit with electric cord, slapping, punching - tied to bed and whipped – torture – gratuitous cruelty – use of weapon - absence of intent to kill did not take case outside “worst case”<br>Insight and remorse demonstrated - longstanding depression                               |
| 46. | <b>CLIFF (No.6)</b><br>(29)<br><a href="#">[2018] NSWSC 587</a><br>Campbell J<br><br><a href="#">[2023] NSWCCA 15</a> | VG<br>Murder<br><br>PG<br>Agg BES<br><br>Stealing                        | 30y<br>NPP 22y<br><br>3y<br><br>1y<br><br><u>Total:</u><br>32y<br>NPP 24y                           | Conviction AD | Not serious -<br>property, driving,<br>assault  | Stabbing<br><br>Intent GBH    | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Killed 16y brother of ex-partner during argument – offender upset by victim’s remarks concerning breakup and property settlement with victim’s sister – intoxicated by ice/ methamphetamine – did not know killed victim until informed by police some hours later - unlikely intent to kill – large number of injuries by knife and blunt force trauma including blow to top of victim’s head – one fatal deep stab wound to area around heart - mid-range<br>Ongoing drug abuse – depressive symptoms |

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)   | PLEA                                   | SENTENCE   | APPEAL | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD                            | HOW KILLED                                     | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY  |
|-----|--|--|--|--------|---|--|--|
| 47. | <b>HOLDEM</b><br>(34 at offence – 44 at sentence)<br><a href="#">[2018] NSWSC 1677</a><br>RA Hulme J | PG<br>2 x Murder                       | Life   |        | includes assault<br>and child sexual<br>assault | Assault /<br>Suffocation<br><br>Intent to kill | <b>SNPP 20 years / 25 years</b><br>Male travelled with 20y female and her 2y daughter from Northern Territory – took adult victim to Belangalo Forest and murdered her by stomping or leaning on chest and throat – motive for killing unclear – complete disdain for victim as human being - sexually abused victim at time or shortly after death and took photos – took victim's daughter and suffocated her en route back to Northern Territory – dumped body in suitcase by side of road – planned to sexually assault child although not clear if this occurred – prompted in part by need to cover up killing of mother - bodies remained unidentified for many years – sent phone messages to victim's mother and accessed victim's bank account for several years – level of culpability so extreme<br>Abusive childhood – regular drug user – actions show danger to community |
| 48. | <b>KHAZMA</b><br>(23)<br><a href="#">[2019] NSWSC 416</a><br>Fullerton J                             | VG<br>Murder<br><br>AOABH<br><br>AOABH | 40y<br>NPP 30y<br><br>FT 3y<br><br>FT 5y<br><br><u>Aggregate</u><br>44y<br>NPP 33y |        | juvenile record                                 | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH                      | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Killed daughter of de facto partner aged 2y 8m – blunt force head and spinal cord injuries – slammed victim's head into wall – next day slapped victim forcing head to hit floor – shook unconscious child with sufficient force to cause further injuries – post mortem revealed 114 inflicted injuries on almost every area of victim's body, including soles of feet - 45 separate sites of bruising, 17 thermal injuries including to perianal area and 28 probable human bite marks – majority of injuries inflicted by offender – uncontrolled rage and lack of appreciation of vulnerability of child<br>Nothing in subjective features provides possible explanation for conduct   |
| 49. | <b>WHITELEY</b><br>(26)<br><a href="#">[2021] NSWSC 153</a><br>Rothman J                             | VG                                     | 35y<br>NPP 24y   |        | Extremely<br>limited                            | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH                      | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Killed 20mth step daughter – 13 injuries to neck and head and 16 injuries to trunk – assault probably started while child in her bed and included being thrown against drawers – spontaneous assault over several minutes with no motive – assault reflected emotional dysfunction related to mental and personality disorder – breach of trust - above mid-range<br>Sexually abused and mistreated as a child – mental health and personality disorder – some remorse – good prospects of rehabilitation – some reduction for conduct of trial  |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA                                       | SENTENCE                                    | APPEAL   | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD                            | HOW KILLED   | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|---|--|---|----------|---|--|---|
| 50. | <b>HOPKINSON</b><br>(18y 10m)<br><br><b>ROBERTSON</b><br>(18y 8m)<br><a href="#">[2021] NSWSC 861</a><br>Ierace J<br><br><a href="#">[2022] NSWCCA 80</a> | PG<br>(25%)<br><br>PG<br>(45%<br>combined) | 12y 9m<br>NPP 8y 3m<br><br>13y 2m<br>NPP 9y | Crown AD | nil   | Assault /<br>constructive /<br>extended JCE<br><br>Assault / intent<br>to kill / JCE | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>17y victim detained in home of offenders over 8 hours – subjected to severe beating by co-accused S and fatally stabbed by S – offence aggravated by use of weapon and commission in company<br>H watched assault and on several occasions took responsibility to keep victim detained – assisted in concealing offence – mid range seriousness<br>R asleep during initial assault – later helped detain victim in car and assaulted victim to head with cricket bat to ‘put him out of his misery’ – non-exculpatory duress - above mid-range<br>H – difficult childhood – some mental health issues – genuine remorse – very good prospects of rehabilitation<br>R – unusually immature – high prospects of rehabilitation – genuine remorse – prior good character - assistance<br>On appeal: sentences light but not manifestly inadequate – discussion as to SNPP where age gap between victim and offenders small |
| 51. | <b>NB</b><br>(45)<br><a href="#">[2022] NSWSC 1013</a><br>Cavanagh J  | VG   | 26y 6m<br>NPP 18y<br>(5%)                   |          | Nil   | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH  | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Female – Foster carer - caring for deceased, child / baby aged 20 months – violent assault – loss of control - forceful blow to stomach –fracture of left femur, stomach perforation, bruising, scratch marks.<br>Unusual case - no pattern of mistreatment leading up to child's death / no violence over lengthy period.<br>Prior good character - unlikely to reoffend - reduction for facilitating administration of justice - special circumstances.   |
| 52. | <b>SHERIDAN (No.2)</b><br>(24)<br><a href="#">[2022] NSWSC 1634</a><br>Garling J  | VG   | 25y<br>NPP 17y                              |          | Drugs, driving,<br>common<br>assault,<br>affray | Intent to kill<br><br>Strangled  | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Strangled 16y male - no motive - victim vulnerable with autism and intellectual disability, alone in apartment – offender impaired such that he did not know that act morally wrong - suffering from drug-induced psychosis result of self-induced acute intoxication - impairment caused solely by temporary effect of ingesting ice – experiencing command hallucinations, in form of voices directing or he would suffer certain consequences - smothering, manual strangulation with bare hands, and strangulation with cord.<br>History of chronic mental illness, drug abuse and addiction (ice) – remorse – PTSD – special circumstances.  |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)   | PLEA   | SENTENCE  | APPEAL | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD  | HOW KILLED                                    | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY  |
|-----|--|--|---|--------|---|---|--|
| 53. | <b>ERDOGAN</b><br>(19 at offence; 23 at sentence)<br><a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 101</a><br>Ierace J                | VG   | 35y<br>NPP 24y  |        | Larceny,<br>common<br>assault, driving,<br>contravening<br>ADVO. On bail. | Assault and<br>stabbing<br><br>Intent to kill | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>With 2 co-offenders - instigated murder of 17y male - assaulted over approximately two hours - motive for assaults, until time of intention to kill, was anger towards victim since earlier argument - tortured over extended period and repeatedly stabbed – hit to head with cricket bat or wrench and kicking or stomping - stabbed in neck area 22 times, snapping blade of knife – degree of premeditation. No remorse - guarded prospects rehabilitation - violence and fact and mode of killing of remain essentially unexplained behaviour – ADHD - long-standing mental health issues sufficiently serious to destabilise education and functioning in society. |
| 54. | <b>KOVALEFF</b><br>(19)<br><a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 302</a><br>Rothman J   | PG<br>(15%)<br><br>Murder<br><br>Wound with<br>intent cause<br>GBH | 34y<br>NPP 24y<br><br>6y 9m<br>NPP 4y 9m<br><br><u>Total:</u><br>36y<br>NPP 26y |        |   | Stabbed<br><br>Intent to kill                 | <b>SNPP 25y</b><br>Stabbed 17y female and wounded 17y girlfriend – previously told girlfriend he wanted to kill her – attended hotel room with both victims intending to kill girlfriend – premeditated and planned two murders – wrapped girlfriend with her clothing and duct tape to keep her alive so as to have sex with her – rang and told father he had stabbed victims<br>Motive elusive - feigned psychiatric illness for two years - impossible to find offender suffers personality disorder - no psychosis or sexual disorder – pathological interest in Ted Bundy, serial killer - borderline intellectual capacity  |
| 55. | <b>KS (No.1)</b><br>(16)<br><a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 696</a><br>Yehia J<br><br><a href="#">[2024] NSWCCA 147</a> | PG<br>(25%)<br>Murder<br><br>GBH with<br>intent cause<br>GBH       | 14y 3m<br><br>7y 6m<br><br><u>Aggregate</u><br>16y<br>NPP 11y                   | AD     | Nil   | Stabbing<br><br>Intent cause<br>GBH           | Single stabbing of 16y male deceased – multiple stabbing of second 16y male victim - ongoing arguments – deceased and second victim approached offender's home yelling abuse – offender took knife and met with victims outside where stabbings took place.<br>Lack of planning and premeditation – intent to cause GBH. Mental health issues - prospects of rehabilitation very good - family support.  |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.



|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA   | SENTENCE  | APPEAL | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD   | HOW KILLED                                   | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|---|--|---|--------|--|--|---|
| 56. | <b>RUMSBY (No.6)</b><br>(30 / 31 at offences –<br>56 at sentence)<br><a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 916</a><br>RA Hulme AJ  | VG<br>Murder<br><br>Att choke with<br>intent to<br>sexually<br>assault | 27y<br>NPP 19y<br><br>10y<br>NPP 7y 6m<br><br><u>Total:</u><br>32y<br>NPP 24y |        | Breached recog<br>– subsequent<br>conviction for<br>indecent assault<br>offences | Asphyxiation<br><br>Intent to kill           | (1998/1999) Approached 18y female waiting outside house<br>in early hours of morning – punched victim to face, forced her<br>to ground, continued punching and attempted sexual assault<br>– 12 mths later followed 17y female walking home along dark<br>road in early hours of morning – sexually motivated attack –<br>suffocated victim – spontaneous offences – elements of<br>brutal violence<br>Old sentencing patterns applied – facilitation of justice –<br>difficult childhood – physical health issues  |
| 57. | <b>BE</b><br>(15)<br><a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1007</a><br>RA Hulme AJ<br><br><a href="#">[2024] NSWCCA 100</a><br><br>Co-offender:<br>BL [2024]<br>AD [2024]<br>SIONE [2024]<br>DAWSON [2024] | PG<br>(25%)  | 15y 6m<br>NPP 10y   | AD     | Minor  | Assault<br><br>Intent GBH<br><br>Accessorial | One of group of people bashed 16y male victim over 33<br>minutes – victim suspected of stealing airpods so lured to<br>home of owner – offender one of four who collected victim<br>from station – victim assaulted by adult male in bedroom<br>while offender and others looked on – when adult male left<br>offender and others continued assault – sustained and<br>extremely vicious involving kicking, punching and stomping –<br>attack filmed – offender delivered at least 52 hits, 3 kicks and<br>hair grab<br>Difficult and disadvantaged childhood involving violence,<br>neglect and exposure to alcohol and drug abuse – exposure<br>to gang culture - uncontrollable behaviour, ADHD and<br>Conduct Disorder – genuine remorse but continued violence<br>in detention makes assessment of rehabilitation prospects<br>difficult – some family support<br>TB [2024] sentenced for manslaughter<br>On appeal: no errors made and sentence not manifestly<br>excessive |
| 58. | <b>AS</b><br>(46)<br><a href="#">[2023] NSWSC 1575</a><br>Wilson J  | VG   | 18y<br>NPP 12y 6m   |        | Nil  | Shaking<br><br>Reckless<br>indifference      | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Shook son, 9m old baby, causing severe brain injury that<br>was the direct cause of death one month later – victim at<br>home with offender – wife returned home to find offender<br>holding victim unresponsive - lost temper, briefly shaking<br>victim - admissions to neighbours immediately after incident,<br>but has since never acknowledged what he had done.<br>No remorse - good character, strong work ethic -<br>rehabilitation prospects reasonably positive.<br>Afghanistan background – trauma - Post Traumatic Stress<br>Disorder.   |

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA   | SENTENCE          | APPEAL | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD                                      | HOW KILLED                           | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|---|--|-------------------|--------|---|--------------------------------------|---|
| 59. | BL<br>(15)<br><a href="#">[2024] NSWSC 51</a><br>RA Hulme AJ<br><br>Co-Offender:<br>BE [2023]<br>AD [2024]<br>SIONE [2024]<br>DAWSON [2024] | PG<br>(25%)  | 15y 6m<br>NPP 10y |        | Of marginal<br>significance                               | Assault<br>Intent GBH<br>Accessorial | One of group of people bashed 16y male victim over 33 minutes – victim suspected of stealing airpods so lured to home of owner – offender phoned and texted victim and was one of four who collected victim from station – victim assaulted by adult male in bedroom while offender and others looked on – when adult male left offender and others continued assault – sustained and extremely vicious involving kicking, punching and stomping – attack filmed<br>Traumatic and dysfunctional childhood including exposure to family violence – PTSD – some evidence of progress in custody – remorse – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – special circumstances permitting offender stay in juvenile custody until 21y<br>TB [2024] sentenced for manslaughter |
| 60. | AA (a pseudonym)<br>(18)<br><a href="#">[2024] NSWSC 409</a><br>Huggett SCJ   | PG<br>(25%)<br><br>Sched:<br>Use offensive<br>weapon with<br>intent to<br>intimidate | 12y 3m<br>NPP 8y  |        | Assault,<br>AOABH,<br>receiving,<br>driving<br>unlicensed | Suffocate<br><br>Intent to kill      | <b>SNPP 25y</b><br>Female - young mother suffocated 11-month-old baby daughter - precise mechanism of suffocation not known - no other violence, neglect or abuse - volatile relationship with child's father - irrational motive that her conduct would lead to resumption of relationship with child's father – belief arose from post-traumatic stress disorder and personality disorder existing at time of offence - intent to kill but intention formed impulsively, without planning and fleeting - mental health impairments closely connected to offending that objective seriousness reduced.<br>Traumatic background – remorse – positive rehabilitation prospects - special circumstances.  |

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA         | SENTENCE                             | APPEAL | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD  | HOW KILLED   | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|---|--------------|--------------------------------------|--------|---|--|---|
| 61. | <b>AD</b><br>(13y 11m)<br><a href="#">[2024] NSWSC 444</a><br>RA Hulme AJ<br><br>Co-Offender:<br>BE [2023]<br>BL [2024]<br>SIONE [2024]<br>DAWSON [2024]        | PG<br>(20%)  | 14y 4m<br>NPP 9y 3m                  |        | nil   | Assault<br><br>Constructive<br>murder<br><br>Accessorial | One of group of people bashed 16y male victim over 33 minutes – victim suspected of stealing airpods so lured to home of owner – victim assaulted by adult male in bedroom while offender and others looked on – when adult male left offender and others continued assault – offender punched, kicked, and stomped on victim – kicked victim to face with such force head hit wall - sustained and extremely vicious assault involving kicking, punching and stomping – attack filmed – liability of offender based on constructive murder resulting from foundational offence of specially aggravated detain for advantage – offender did not intend or contemplate GBH and played no role in luring victim to house<br>Youth – remorse – reasonable prospects of rehabilitation – difficult childhood including exposure to violence and substance abuse, gang membership and lack of parental guidance reducing moral culpability<br>TB [2024] sentenced for manslaughter   |
| 62. | <b>SIONE</b><br>(32)<br><br><b>DAWSON</b><br>(19)<br><a href="#">[2024] NSWSC 846</a><br>RA Hulme AJ<br><br>Co-offenders<br>BE [2023]<br>BL [2024]<br>AD [2024] | VG<br><br>VG | 32y<br>NPP 24y<br><br>20y<br>NPP 13y |        | Significant<br>violence –<br>breached<br>conditional<br>liberty<br><br>Record –<br>breached<br>conditional<br>liberty | Assault<br><br>Accessorial<br>liability                  | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>16y male bashed by group over 33 minutes – victim accused by D of stealing airpods so lured to her home – assault in bedroom initiated by S and continued by other male juvenile offenders after S left – D encouraged assault by presence, words and filming – frenzied assault involving extreme violence on vulnerable and defenceless victim – S older and took lead in offence – greater liability than co-offenders – liability based on joint criminal enterprise to inflict GBH – liability of D based on extended joint criminal enterprise to detain and assault foreseeing possibility of intentional GBH<br>S - Samoan / Tongan heritage – suggestion of difficult childhood but does not reduce moral culpability – mental health issues – onerous custodial conditions<br>D – female - significant cognitive impairment reducing moral culpability – behavioural and mental health issues – difficult childhood– onerous custodial conditions – genuine remorse – special circumstances<br>TB [2024] sentenced for manslaughter |

|     | NAME<br>(age if known)  | PLEA        | SENTENCE       | APPEAL | SUMMARY OF<br>RECORD  | HOW KILLED                     | INVOLVEMENT & SUMMARY   |
|-----|---|-------------|----------------|--------|---|--------------------------------|---|
| 63. | AYLWARD<br>(18)<br><a href="#">[2024] NSWSC 923</a><br>Wilson J | PG<br>(25%) | 18y<br>NPP 12y |        | nil   | Stabbed<br><br>Intent to kill  | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Offender entered home of 17y male acquaintance late at night and fatally stabbed victim asleep in bed – had been told by family member victim had physically hurt her on earlier occasion – 12 stab wounds to head and upper torso – savage attack - some element of planning<br>Childhood marred by physical, sexual and drug abuse – youth, immaturity and PTSD – reduction in moral culpability under <i>Bugmy</i> – physical health conditions – remorse - out of character   |
| 64. | STEIN<br>(32)<br><a href="#">[2024] NSWSC 1080</a><br>Wilson J  | VG          | Life           |        | Dishonesty and drug offences – breached parole at time of offence | Shooting<br><br>Intent to kill | <b>SNPP 25 years</b><br>Shot 9y daughter of fiancé while victim in offender's care in remote residence in Blue Mountains – shot victim in hip then at point blank range in face – victim vulnerable because of age, drowsiness due to drug and isolation – used stolen rifle – motive unknown – breach of trust – took elaborate steps in attempt to dispose of body over several days – placed body in barrel, filled with sand and rolled towards river – lied to fiancé suggesting victim first being cared for then kidnapped – offence at top of range<br>No mitigation of moral culpability – no remorse – rejected claims of mental illness – bleak prospects of rehabilitation – danger to community<br><br><b>Reasons for life sentence: vulnerability of victim and nature of killing and - moral culpability undiminished by any mitigating factors – strong community interest in heavy punishment and retribution being visited on the offender.- risk of future offending - specific and general deterrence</b> |

Last updated: Aug 2024

This table has been prepared by the Public Defenders as a guide. Individual cases should be read if they are to be relied upon.